1	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF INDIANA
3	INDIANAPOLIS DIVISION
4	
5	RED BARN MOTORS, INC., PLATINUM MOTORS INC., et
6	al.
7	
8	PLAINTIFFS
9	V.
10	CASE NO. 1:14-cv-01589-TWP-DKL
11	
12	COX ENTERPRISES, INC., et al.
13	
14	DEFENDANTS
15	
16	
10	
17	DEPOSITION FOR THE DEFENDANTS,
	DEPOSITION FOR THE DEFENDANTS, COX ENTERPRISES, INC., et al.:
17	
17 18	
17 18 19	COX ENTERPRISES, INC., et al.:
17 18 19 20	COX ENTERPRISES, INC., et al.: The Deposition of Rule 30(b)(6) Witness, Barry
17 18 19 20 21	COX ENTERPRISES, INC., et al.: The Deposition of Rule 30(b)(6) Witness, Barry Wayne Mattingly, on Behalf of Mattingly Auto Sales,
17 18 19 20 21 22	COX ENTERPRISES, INC., et al.: The Deposition of Rule 30(b)(6) Witness, Barry Wayne Mattingly, on Behalf of Mattingly Auto Sales, Incorporated, taken in the above-styled matter at



October 19, 2016 21

1 Α. No. 2 [WHEREUPON, phone rings.] 3 MR. JURKIEWICZ: Are we -- no question 4 pending? 5 MR. MCCARTER: No. 6 BY MR. MCCARTER: 7 All right. And do you remember the name 0. 8 of the officer or officers you met with? 9 Α. Yes. 10 Ο. What was --11 Curtis Mouser. And I don't -- don't know Α. 12 how to spell that for you. I'm sorry. 13 O. Okay. There was the one interview, 14 and --15 Α. Yes. 16 -- did he pull records from you? Ο. 17 Yes. Well, no. He actually had pulled Α. 18 them himself. 19 Ο. From where? 20 Α. The courthouse. All property records, 21 everything, financial records from liens, that kind 22 of thing. 23 All right. You said it was embezzling, but 24 did he give you any more sense specifically what



he was looking at?

- 1 A. He was looking at to see what we --
- 2 | basically, he was looking for money possibly that
- 3 | we had borrowed. That's what he was -- told us he
- 4 | was looking at.
- 5 Q. Okay. But we're not talking about --
- 6 A. Liens on properties and that kind of
- 7 thing.
- 8 Q. Okay. Did he ever formally tell you he
- 9 | was done looking?
- 10 A. Yes. His -- I think his quote was, and he
- 11 | looked at my lawyer as he looked at the paper and
- 12 | said, "I can't find anything here."
- 13 Q. Okay. And that all -- that all happened in
- 14 | May of 2012?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 O. Okay. How -- do you have any other
- 17 | employees now?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Have you in the last ten years or so?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. Do you have any other representatives
- 22 | who might buy cars for you or the like?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. And who are they?
- 25 A. Different people. Just to give you some



- 1 names, Kenny Barker.
- 2 Q. Okay.
- 3 A. In the past -- in the past, a guy named
- 4 | Sherman Dow, Frankie Anthony. I think -- I think
- 5 Butch Fentress.
- 6 0. Contress?
- 7 A. Fentress, F-e-n-t-r-e-s-s.
- 8 Q. Okay. Have these folks all been reps for
- 9 you in the last ten years or so?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 | Q. Are any of them still reps for you?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. And by "reps," I mean representatives
- 14 | who might --
- 15 A. Per -- per -- person who --
- 16 | 0. -- who might buy or sell cars for you?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. And they do that at auctions?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. And again talking about Mr. Barker, Mr.
- 21 Dow, Mr. Anthony, Mr. Fentress, did they have
- 22 | their own dealerships, or did they buy personally
- 23 | for you?
- 24 A. They bought cars for -- through me; yes.
- 25 Q. Okay. Do they do any selling for you?



October 19, 2016 24

1	A. Vehicles they bought were generally for
2	themselves to sell or for family members or
3	something like that to re-sell.

- Q. But they would still do that on your account?
- 6 A. Yes.

4

- Q. All right. So what auctions are you dealing at today?
- 9 A. Wolfes, W-o-l-f-e-s, Wolfes Auto Auction, 10 and that's in Evansville.
- 11 Q. Any others?
- 12 A. That's it, pretty much it. I do go to a
- 13 few, but rarely, E-town Auto Auction.
- 14 Q. Say it again.
- 15 A. E-town.
- 16 Q. E-town?
- 17 A. Elizabethtown Auto Auction.
- 18 Q. And where -- is that Kentucky?
- 19 A. Yeah, Kentucky. That's actually --
- 20 actually outside of E-town, just call it E-town. And
- 21 | then also one more that I go to occasionally is
- 22 | Clark County Auto Auction.
- Q. Can you think of any others you've gone
- 24 to since May of 2012?
- 25 A. That's it.



October 19, 2016 25

1	Q.	Okay.	You	don't	have	internal	legal
2	counse	1; do y	ou?				

- A. No.
- 4 Q. Okay. How many cars are on your lot
- 5 now?

- 6 A. One.
- 7 Q. Do you have more than one lot?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. Where is your lot?
- 10 A. Hardinsburg, Kentucky.
- 11 Q. Can you give me the full address?
- 12 A. Yeah. It's 3826 South Highway 261, and
- 13 | that's in Hardinsburg, H-a-r-d-i-n-s-b-u-r-g,
- 14 Kentucky.
- 15 Q. Okay. Since you incorporated in 2003ish,
- 16 | have you had other lots?
- 17 | A. No.
- 18 | 0. When you're buying and wholesaling cars
- 19 | today, do you bring those back to your lot, or do
- 20 | they go straight to other locations?
- 21 A. Usually, bring them to the lot.
- 22 | Q. And what's an average number of cars
- 23 | you've had on your lot since 2012, roughly?
- 24 A. Probably one to two.
- 25 Q. And before 2012?



1	Α.	∇V	had	20	mant	20	15	+ 0	20
		WC	Had	ab	шашу	ab	エン	$\mathcal{L}\mathcal{O}$	∠∪.

- 2 Q. Is it fair to say that would matter more
- 3 | when you have retail buyers, the need --
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. -- to see the cars. Now, I understand you
- 6 buy and sell cars. Is it the profit on those cars
- 7 | that you -- is that how you make your money?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Okay. So you're trying to buy them low
- 10 | and sell them high?
- 11 A. Correct.
- 12 Q. Do you do anything else to make money
- 13 | as Mattingly Auto Sales, Inc.?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. No financing?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 | O. No service?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. No parts?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 O. Okay. Has that been true the whole time?
- 22 A. The whole time.
- 23 Q. Okay. Do you specialize in a particular
- 24 | type of car?
- 25 A. No.



1	Q.	No.	You sti	ll buying	classic	cars?
---	----	-----	---------	-----------	---------	-------

- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. All your cars are used, though?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. But they can be any different age?
- 6 A. Correct.
- 7 Q. Any different value?
- $8 \mid A. M-hm.$
- 9 Q. You can sell a high end Porsche and -- as
- 10 | well as a low end --
- 11 A. Not where --
- 12 | 0. -- Sentra?
- 13 | A. -- I'm from.
- 14 Q. Okay. So you are specializing a little bit
- 15 | in lower end cars?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. Okay. And what's an average price for
- 18 | it?
- 19 A. The one we have for sale today is \$2200.
- 20 Q. Just curious, what kind of car is it?
- 21 A. It's a 2002 Mazda Millenia.
- 22 | Q. Has the type of car you specialize in
- 23 | changed since 2012?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. In what way?



- 1 A. Basically, lower end cars, not -- not the
- 2 higher dollar SUVs, trucks, sporty cars, you know.
- 3 | From, say, a \$15,000 car, now we're down to the
- 4 under \$5,000 cars.
- 5 Q. Okay. But even before 2012, we're
- 6 | talking mid range 15, 20,000?
- 7 A. M-hm.
- 8 Q. Okay. Do you ever get cars from other
- 9 | dealers?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 0. Outside of an auction?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 0. Okay. And when and what does that look
- 14 | like?
- 15 A. Just the same. Just if they have
- 16 | something they want to -- they don't want to --
- 17 | they'll take to the auction they don't want, I'll
- 18 | shoot them a price if I -- you know, if it's worth the
- 19 | money, I'll buy it, they'll sell it to me.
- 20 Q. Okay. Any estimate of what percentage
- 21 | of your deals are from --
- 22 A. No. No. Wouldn't -- wouldn't have any
- 23 | idea.
- Q. Okay. Besides auctions, other dealers,
- 25 | any other way you get cars?



- 1 A. That's about it.
- 2 Q. Trade-ins?
- 3 A. Yes. If -- if there's a trade-in, yes, we
- 4 do that.
- 5 Q. Okay. What about online? Do you buy
- 6 | anything online?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. You're aware of SmartAuction, eBay
- 9 | Motors --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. -- those kind of things?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 O. And you don't use any of those?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 | O. Okay. Is that by choice?
- 16 A. Yes. I just don't -- nothing worth putting
- 17 on there.
- 18 Q. Okay. I just wanted -- I asked you this
- 19 | before, but you don't sell any add-ons or anything
- 20 | like that, insurance products, any --
- 21 A. No. No.
- 22 Q. Okay. So if -- if you do have a retail
- 23 | deal, what is the form of payment typically on
- 24 | those? Is it cash or something else?
- 25 A. Cash, check, whatever; m-hm. We don't



- finance unless they have their own financing or something. We don't do it ourselves.
 - Q. Have you ever done self financing?
- 4 A. No, not through us. We used to finance
- 5 through another dealer who had financial options.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 A. We never had nothing ourselves.
- 8 Q. So if the buyer comes in with cash, a
- 9 certified check, or a bank loan, you can take that?
- 10 A. Right.
- 11 Q. But you won't do a buy here pay here
- 12 | deal?

- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. Okay. When -- what period of time were
- 15 | you doing the buy here pay here deals through
- 16 | another dealer?
- 17 A. Well, it wasn't -- it was through a bank,
- 18 through a bank. It was never a buy here pay here.
- 19 | It was -- it -- we quit that in 2012, I guess.
- 20 O. Okay. Who was that bank?
- 21 A. Fort Knox Credit Union.
- 22 Q. Say it again.
- 23 A. Fort Knox -- Fort Knox Federal Credit
- 24 Union.
- 25 Q. Okay. When you were working with Fort



1 Knox, what did those contracts look like? 2 just a loan from Fort Knox to the consumer, and 3 then they would pay you directly? 4 Actually, the -- the loan, I would go 5 through another dealer. They did all the 6 I would -- I -- I didn't have an account paperwork. 7 I would just send the paperwork, the with them. 8 app -- they would fill out an application, I would 9 send it to that dealer, that dealer would do all the 10 paperwork. 11 MR. JURKIEWICZ: Matt? 12 MR. COMAN: I'm here. 13 MR. JURKIEWICZ: We're on the record. 14 Matt Coman is joining. 15 MR. COMAN: I apologize for the 16 interruption. 17 BY MR. MCCARTER: 18 And so please tell me if this is wrong, but 19 so you -- you would make the deal with the 20 consumer, then you would send the paperwork to 21 another dealer, and they would send it in to Fort 22 Knox Credit Union? 23 Α. Yes. 24 And then Fort Knox would cut a check to Ο. 25 you?



- A. To -- no, to Wheatley, to the -- the dealer, to the dealer, and then they would pay me.
 - Q. Okay. And what's Wheatley's full name?
- 4 A. It was Wheatley Motor Company. They
- 5 have since gone out of business.
- Q. Do you know whether Wheatley was -- was
- 7 running a buy here pay here contract where they

would keep getting payments from the consumer,

- 9 or was everything paid off up front by their --
- 10 A. Everything was paid by Fort Knox Credit
- 11 Union to them.

3

- 12 Q. Okay. Any other form of financing you've
- 13 used for your sales?
- 14 A. No. Not our sales; no.
- Q. Okay. When you get a trade-in, how do
- 16 | you deal with that?
- 17 A. You just value it, and they pay the
- 18 difference.
- 19 Q. So you write a contract for the new car,
- 20 you give some trade-in credit, and they pay the
- 21 difference?
- 22 A. Correct.
- 23 Q. In some of those cases, you have to pay
- 24 off a previous lienholder?
- 25 A. Some; yes.



- Q. When you were working with Wheatley and
 Fort Knox, if there were a trade-in, they would just
 finance the net?
- A. No. I would -- I would have to put that -- my money into the trade.
 - Q. Can you explain that to me? I'm sorry.
 - A. All right. Let's say I sold a \$10,000 car.
- 8 | O. M-hm.

6

7

- 9 A. They -- Fort Knox would finance the
- 10 | \$10,000 car and pay them the 10, but I would have
- 11 | to buy -- basically, I bought the trade. So
- 12 | Wheatley's would never -- or Fort Knox were never
- 13 involved in the trade. It was just a straight deal
- 14 on the -- on the car purchased.
- And off the top of my head, I don't know that
- 16 that ever happened. I can't remember an instance
- where we got a trade that was financed through the
- 18 | credit union. So that might not -- that's how it
- worked, but I'm not sure if it ever happened. I'm
- 20 | not -- I can't remember.
- 21 Q. Okay. If there -- if you do take a trade-in
- 22 | and there's a lien on it and you send payment,
- 23 | then you get title back from the lienholder?
- 24 A. Yes. Or lien statement; yes.
 - Q. And then you have that put into your



October 19, 2016 35

1 Don't forget to let him MS. LASKY: 2 finish his entire question. You're doing great, just 3 give him a little more time. 4 BY MR. MCCARTER: 5 Is it fair to say those wholesale auto 6 auctions kind of work in the same manner? 7 Α. Yes. 8 Okay. Can you tell me just generally --0. 9 I -- and then we'll break it down -- how it works? 10 How do you go in, get a car from an auction? Basically, you just go in with your card, 11 Α. 12 go up there, bid on it through the on kube --13 through the lines. Once you get your ticket, go 14 pay for it, and sign the ticket, get your gate pass, 15 and go home. 16 With the car or without the car? 0. 17 Α. With the car. 18 Okay. So it's a competitive environment 0. 19 where you've got multiple dealers trying to get the 20 car? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Somehow you scout out the ones you Q. 23 want, and then you bid on them, and if you win the 24 bid, you have to pay for the car, and then you take



25

it?

1	Α.	Yes.	

- 2 Q. Okay. Have you ever sold at auctions?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. How often?
- 5 A. Well, that's the -- part of the wholesale
- 6 stuff. You know, it was back before 2012
- 7 | practically every week.
- 8 Q. Okay. So you've been both the buyer and
- 9 | seller at auction?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. On hundreds of cars?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 0. Okay. How -- how does it work from the
- 14 | seller's side? When do you get paid by the
- 15 | auction?
- 16 A. If I sell?
- 17 | O. Yeah.
- 18 A. If I turn in a title, when you -- when you
- 19 | run a car -- if you sell it, I -- I would have to go up
- 20 | front to give them the title, you know, if it's out of
- 21 | state or Kentucky title, Kentucky being you have to
- 22 | have the dealer signed properly. They turn it in,
- 23 | and they issue me a check.
- 0. Okay. And that check comes from the
- 25 | auction, not the buyer?



- 1 A. Auction; m-hm.
- 2 | Q. And so when you're a buyer, you pay the
- 3 | auction, when you're a seller, you get paid by the
- 4 | auction?
- 5 A. Correct.
- 6 Q. Okay. Is that part of the reason you go
- 7 | to auction, to sort of make sure that you get paid
- 8 | if you're a seller?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And for the buyer, that's a way to be sure
- 11 | you get a title?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 0. And can the buyer usually take the car
- 14 | immediately, or is there any kind of waiting
- 15 | period?
- 16 A. Usually, if it's -- as long as there's no
- 17 | problems with the car, they have that opportunity
- 18 | to ride and drive, to inspect the car to make sure
- 19 | it's proper, what they advertised, and if it's given
- 20 | a time frame, let's say an hour to check it out --
- 21 Q. Yeah.
- 22 A. -- then you have to go up and pay for it,
- 23 and you take it the same day.
- 24 | 0. And is it my understanding that there's --
- 25 or it is my understanding that there's some



- 1 situations where you might have longer if there
- 2 | was some issue with the car, if it's a --
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. -- frame damage or something?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Okay. So there's -- the auction provides
- 7 | certain relief in cases if a car wasn't disclosed
- 8 properly?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. So what are the different ways a buyer
- 11 | can pay for the car at the auction?
- 12 A. Well, you can write them a check, or if
- 13 | you have a floor plan company you can put it on
- 14 | the floor plan.
- 15 | O. I'll come back to the floor plan in a
- 16 | minute, but can you also pay cash?
- 17 A. Yes. Check or cash; yes.
- 18 O. Does it have to be a certified check or
- 19 | business check or what?
- 20 A. Business check.
- 21 Q. Okay. So in all cases, you have to find
- 22 | some way to pay for the car before you take it?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 O. All right. So you said floor plan is one
- 25 | way you can get the car out of the auction.



- 1 Explain to me what that means, and how does that 2 work?
- A. If I had a -- if I had an auction ticket before from where I purchased the car --
- 5 Q. M-hm.
- A. -- I would take it to the person that's called a finance officer, whoever it would be that
- 8 does that, that's their job. They would scan it,
- 9 initial it, scan it, put it in their system, stamp it,
- 10 | initial it, something so where you can get it out of
- 11 the gate. Like make like a gate pass of where you
- 12 | can take the car out.
- Q. But they would have to know that you had
- 14 | credit available from the floor planner in advance?
- 15 A. Right.
- 16 Q. Okay. And tell me if this is wrong, but a
- 17 | floor -- a high level floor planner is somebody you
- 18 | have a line of credit with to buy cars?
- 19 A. M-hm.
- 20 Q. Right?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And so somehow the floor planner
- 23 and the auction communicate about how much
- 24 | credit you have as Mattingly Auto Sales, and then
- you can just say, "Put it on my floor plan"?



	RED BARN	MOTORS vs. COX ENTERPRISES 40
1	Α.	Yes.
2		MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
3	BY MR.	MCCARTER:
4	Q.	Have you used all those different forms of
5	paymen	t: cash, check, floor plan?
6	Α.	Yes.
7	Q.	So at a high level after you get a car at
8	auction	n, then what do you do with it as far as
9	busine	ss?
10	Α.	Just
11		MS. LASKY: Object to the form. You can
12	answer	•
13		THE WITNESS: Okay.
14	Α.	Just take it to the lot, clean it up,
15	whateve	er it needs to be, put it up for sale.
16	BY MR.	MCCARTER:
17	Q.	Okay. Would you typically re-sell a car
18	at the	same auction, or would you do something
19	differe	ently?
20	Α.	Typically, the way I operate I would take
21	it to a	another auction.
22	Q.	And so you might buy it at an auction
	_	

- Q. And so you might buy it at an auction
 where it's less valued, and take it to an auction
 where it's more valued?
- 25 A. Yes.



- 1 | 0. So you said when you're the seller you
- 2 | have to provide the title to get paid; right?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 0. And so does that sometime -- does that
- 5 | always happen on sale day?
- 6 A. I tried to, but sometimes it didn't happen,
- 7 | you know. They would -- I wouldn't get paid -- I
- 8 | never got paid until I provided them a title.
- 9 Q. But that sounds like some sellers can
- 10 | provide it later; is that right?
- 11 A. Oh, yeah, you -- you can turn it in later.
- 12 | They would charge you a fee for that, but I would
- 13 | never get paid unless I produced a title.
- 14 Q. All right. But does a buyer -- does a
- 15 | buyer know the title is not going to be available
- 16 | immediately?
- 17 A. Some do; yes.
- 18 Q. And how do they -- how do you know that?
- 19 A. Well, it's -- it's always have to announce
- 20 | it. It's called TA.
- 21 Q. Okay.

- 22 A. It would be title absent. And it kind of
- 23 | goes up on the screen, and they know there will
- 24 | not be a title at that time.
 - Q. Okay. Did you ever buy a car TA?



- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. What -- what -- why would you buy a car
- 3 | TA if you can't immediately re-sell it?
- 4 A. Because eventually they'll -- they'll get
- 5 | me title. They have a -- a time frame usually of
- 6 | three weeks. If they don't provide you with a clear
- 7 | title, you can take the car back, and the deal is
- 8 | canceled.
- 9 Q. Okay. In that mean -- in the meantime,
- 10 | can you go ahead and get the car ready and start
- 11 | offering it?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Did you ever re-sell a car before you got
- 14 | the title from the auction?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 0. How often has that happened?
- 17 | A. It was rare.
- 18 0. Did you ever have a situation where that
- 19 | title never shows up and you have to unwind the
- 20 | deal?
- 21 A. It -- I have had a few, very few,
- 22 | fortunately.
- 23 | Q. And I know we've -- this has been a fairly
- 24 general conversation, but has that been the sort of
- 25 | process at auction the whole time from 2003



to 2016?

- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay. All right. We -- we talked about
- 4 | these floor plan lines of credit. Is that a common
- 5 | term in the industry, floor plan?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. So what floor plans have -- has Mattingly
- 8 Auto Sales worked with?
- 9 A. We had AFC, DSC, MAFS, M-A-F-S, which
- 10 | you're familiar with, and, of course, now NextGear.
- 11 Q. All right. What period did you work with
- 12 | AFC?
- 13 A. They were -- they were my first. I'm
- 14 going to say starting in 2003, give or take.
- 15 | O. Until when?
- 16 A. To two thousand probably 9.
- 17 | O. And what was the size of your line during
- 18 | that period?
- 19 A. Probably 100,000.
- 20 Q. And why did that get closed at some
- 21 | point?
- 22 A. I closed it. Their fees were high.
- 23 | Q. All right. And what period did you work
- 24 | with DSC?
- 25 A. I'm going to say 6 or 7 through 2012.



October 19, 2016 44

1	Q.	And	the	size	of	your	lines	during	that	
2	period	?								

- A. It increased up to 150 is my final -- final
- 4 line.

- 5 Q. From 100?
- 6 A. From 100 to 150.
- 7 Q. And high level, that means you can buy
- 8 | \$150,000 worth of cars and put them on that line
- 9 of credit?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Okay. And what period were you with
- 12 MAFS?
- 13 A. I'd say from 2003 or 4 to 2012.
- 14 Q. Do you remember the size of that line?
- 15 A. I believe it was 100, but I -- I don't
- 16 | remember.
- 17 | 0. And so there's some overlap between
- 18 | those three lines so you would -- you would have
- 19 | multiple lines at the same time sometimes?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Okay. And why would you have more than
- 22 one?
- 23 A. Just more -- more credit.
- Q. So you can buy more cars that way?
- 25 A. Yes.



- 1 O. Okay. And you said NextGear, but is
- 2 | that -- did you have a separate line with NextGear,
- 3 or was that DSC just became NextGear?
- 4 A. It was when NextGear -- actually, it was
- 5 DSC, MAFS, and then they combined.
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 A. I never had actually a NextGear account.
- 8 They were owned by NextGear.
- 9 Q. So your DSC and MAFS lines were closed
- 10 | before they joined and called it NextGear?
- 11 A. They actually -- right the same year. I
- 12 | think they joined in 2012.
- 13 Q. Sure. But you -- you never had a line
- 14 | called a NextGear line?
- 15 A. No. No.
- 16 O. All right. And so when you use a floor
- 17 | plan to buy at auction, I think you just said you
- 18 | tell the finance person to put it on your line?
- 19 A. M-hm. Correct.
- 20 Q. You have to tell them which, AFC --
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. -- DSC?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 O. Okay. And do they call right then, or do
- 25 | you see how they interact with the floor planner to



- 1 know your credit?
- 2 A. No. They actually, they -- most -- a
- 3 | majority of the time they just scanned it and went
- 4 on. I never -- never was close to being over, so
- 5 | there never was a problem.
- 6 Q. Okay. You never got a call the next day
- 7 | saying you didn't have the credit?
- 8 A. Right.
- 9 Q. Okay. And do you have any
- 10 understanding of sort of why these floor planners
- 11 | would let you use their money?
- 12 A. I just -- they fill out an application.
- 13 That's the only reason.
- 14 | Q. I just meant, what is -- they're just
- 15 getting something, interest and fees, I guess, or --
- 16 A. Oh, yes. Yes, interest and fees.
- Q. And so, if you put a -- if you buy a car at
- 18 auction, you put it on your DSC line, you don't
- 19 have to pay cash for it that day?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. But presumably, you have to pay DSC
- 22 | back for it later?
- 23 A. Whenever I sell it or pay it off; yes. And
- 24 | they were. . .
- 25 Q. All right. So just generally under a DCS



- 1 line during 2006-2012, what was your
- 2 | understanding of when payment would be due for
- 3 | the money you borrowed?
- 4 A. When I sell --
- 5 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 6 A. When I sold the car.
- 7 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 8 Q. That second? Within a day?
- 9 A. I think they had -- I think in their
- 10 | paperwork they had a three-day period. I'd have
- 11 | to look back at that to see.
- 12 Q. What if you never sold the car? Is there
- 13 | some sort of cut off?
- 14 A. Yeah. I think -- I don't want to --
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form. Go
- 16 | ahead.
- 17 A. I -- I believe it was 120, 120 days with
- 18 DSC. I could be wrong.
- 19 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 A. But I rare -- I rarely ever -- never -- I
- 22 | don't think it ever happened. I either sold it or
- 23 | took it back to the auction, whatever.
- 24 Q. But there -- there would be a maturity
- 25 | date if you didn't pay?



October 19, 2016 48

_	_	<u>.</u> .
1	Ι Α.	Correct.

- Q. Okay. And did AFC work the same way?
- 3 A. Yes.

- 4 O. What -- do you remember what their
- 5 | maturity date was?
- 6 A. No, I don't.
- 7 Q. What about MAFS, the same way?
- 8 A. Pretty much the same.
- 9 Q. So you'd have to pay a car if you sold it
- 10 | within a short time period, and then, if you didn't
- 11 | sell it, there would be a cut off?
- 12 A. Right.
- 13 O. Okay. Were those floor plans limited to
- 14 | cars you bought at auction?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 0. So you could take a car you bought from
- 17 | another dealer and put it on floor plan?
- 18 A. Trade; m-hm.
- 19 Q. Okay. Was that process any different?
- 20 | How did you --
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. Well, how -- so did they pay the dealer
- 23 | directly?
- A. No, they paid -- they would pay me.
- 25 | Yeah, they paid me.



- 1 So it sounds a little different; right? Ο. 2 You're going to have to submit some paperwork --3 Α. Yeah. Yes. 4 -- and you're going to get payment? Ο. 5 Α. I would -- I would produce a title to them, and they would pay me for the trade. Put it on the 6 7 floor plan for that amount, I quess you'd say. 8 So how did they know the amount to 9 finance? 10 Usually, my treasurer would work the 11 money, or they have a -- they have a guide they go 12 by. 13 So some way you would show them what Ο. 14 you paid for it, they would compare to it some 15 value quide, and --16 Α. M-hm. 17 -- they would finance that amount? Ο. 18 Α. Yes. 19 Okay. What about at auction, did they Ο.
- 22

20

21

A. No.

much for it?

- 23
- Q. So they would just go with the auction

ever reject your financing because you paid too

- 24
- 25 A. Yes.

price?



Did you have some understanding that the 1 Ο. 2 cars you acquired were -- were collateral for the 3 loans? 4 Α. Yes. Do you understand what I mean by 5 0. 6 collateral? 7 Α. Yes. 8 Q. They could pick up the cars if they didn't 9 get paid? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Ο. Okay. And that was true of all the floor 12 planners? 13 Α. Yes. 14 Do you -- do you know what security 15 interest means? 16 Α. No. 17 Okay. And so you would -- the -- the 18 general way it worked, would -- you would repay 19 the principal you borrowed, plus interest, plus fees 20 to the floor planner for the cars you bought? 21 Α. Yes. Okay. How would you know exactly how 22 23 Like, how much the principal much to pay them?

was, plus the interest, plus the fees?

They had a website with the



Computer.

Α.

24

1	balances.								
2	Q. DSC did?								
3	A. Yes, both. And MAFS.								
4	Q. So each time you needed to pay off a								
5	unit, you would look it up on the website and then								
6	pay that amount?								
7	A. Yes.								
8	Q. Was that typically by ACH electronic								
9	payment or by check?								
10	A. Yes, ACH.								
11	Q. ACH; okay. Was that true the whole time								
12	you were with DSC?								
13	A. Yes.								
14	Q. Is that true the whole time you were with								
15	MAFS?								
16	A. Well, MAFS MAFS worked a little								
17	different. I could pay off online or at the auction,								
18	because they held the titles at the auction. So it								
19	was convenient.								
20	Q. And you did both?								
21	A. Yes.								
22	Q. What about statements, did you get								
23	statements from DSC?								
24	A. No. It only thing we had was the								



online.

1	Q.	Okay.	Did	you l	nave	a s	ecure	log-	-in yo	ou
2	could	look at	any	time	and	see	what	you	were	

- 3 | what you owed DSC?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Okay. Same with MAFS?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 O. How about AFC?
- 8 A. I -- they might have. I don't remember
- 9 about AFC.
- 10 Q. Okay. So other than AFC, DSC, and
- 11 | MAFS, have you ever entered into any inventory
- 12 | financing arrangement with anybody else?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. Do you have any inventory financing
- 15 | arrangement now?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 | 0. How do you pay for cars you buy now?
- 18 A. Just strictly cash.
- 19 Q. And that's out of just operations of the
- 20 business?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Okay. But at Wolfes, E-town, and Clark
- 23 | County, they still take your business checks?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 MS. LASKY: Can we just take a quick --



October 19, 2016 53

1 MR. MCCARTER: Yeah. 2 MS. LASKY: -- break? 3 MR. MCCARTER: That's fine. 4 [WHEREUPON, a brief recess is taken.] [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked 5 Defendants' Exhibit 2 for identification.] 6 7 BY MR. MCCARTER: 8 Ο. Let me show you a couple of documents, 9 break up the monotony here. I'll represent to you 10 this is just a printout from the State of Kentucky 11 website, and it shows Mattingly Auto Sales, Inc. 12 being incorporated in March of 2003; do you see 13 that? 14 Α. Yes. 15 Does that look right to you? Ο. 16 Α. Yes. 17 Okay. And it's -- as you testified earlier, Ο. 18 it shows you and Ms. Mattingly as the officers; do 19 you see that? 20 Α. Yes. 21 Okay. Do you see anything on this that Ο. 22 looks wrong to you? 23 Α. No, I don't. Okay. Do -- side question: Do you --24 0. 25 does Mattingly Auto Sales do its own tax returns?



October 19, 2016 54

- Q. You file tax returns in the name of
- 3 | Mattingly Auto --
- 4 A. Yes.

- 5 Q. -- Sales, Inc.?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And who prepares those?
- 8 A. Jackson Hewitt.
- 9 Q. Okay. And you have those going back
- 10 | several years?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Do you have any from pre-2012?
- 13 A. Prob -- I'm sure we do, but I don't know
- 14 how far back we kept.
- 15 O. Okay. And if I didn't say it, that's
- 16 | Exhibit 2. I'm going to show you what we're going
- 17 | to call Defendants' Exhibit 3.
- 18 | [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked]
- 19 | Defendants' Exhibit 3 for identification.]
- 20 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 21 Q. It's two pages front -- one front, one
- 22 | back. And I'll represent to you this is just a
- 23 | printout from what appears to be your website, and
- 24 | you can see at the bottom it was printed on
- 25 October 12th, 2016; do you see that?



- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. Does this look like your website?
- 3 A. No, this is not my website or my car lot.
- 4 Q. So it's not you at all?
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. Okay. You -- you see on that first page,
- 7 | even though it's got a Hardinsburg office --
- 8 A. M-hm.
- 9 Q. -- this is not you?
- 10 A. No, that's not my office.
- 11 Q. Do you know who -- who this dealer is?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 O. Do they have any connection to you?
- 14 | A. No. Other -- well, one. Name.
- 15 | O. Okay.
- 16 A. Outside of that, no.
- 17 | O. All right. Do you have a website?
- 18 | A. No.
- 19 Q. Okay. All right. It's not a very important
- 20 exhibit, but it's now marked as an exhibit.
- 21 All right. I think you said your relationship
- 22 | with DSC would have began around 2006?
- 23 A. I believe so.
- 24 Q. And your relationship with MAFS began
- 25 | before that; right?



	RED BARN MOTORS vs. COX ENTERPRISES	56
1	A. Yes.	
2	Q. Okay. I'll go ahead and show you another	
3	document we may use later. This will be	
4	Defendants' Exhibit 4.	
5	[WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked	
6	Defendants' Exhibit 4 for identification.]	
7	BY MR. MCCARTER:	
8	Q. And these I'll represent to you are your	
9	interrogatory responses in this case. You	
10	take take as much time as you want, but I'm	
11	not I'll call your attention to anything specific	2
12	we need to cover, but have you seen this document	
13	before?	
14	A. Yes.	
15	Q. And do you recall participating in	
16	preparing these responses?	
17	A. Yes.	
18	Q. And you reviewed and they're true, to the	
19	best of your knowledge?	
20	λ Vec	

- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Okay.
- MS. LASKY: And I'll represent to you we
- 23 | have a verification that I'll give to you-all
- 24 tomorrow.
- MR. MCCARTER: Okay. Signed by Mr.



October 19, 2016 57

1 Mattingly? 2 MS. LASKY: Correct. 3 MR. MCCARTER: Okay. 4 BY MR. MCCARTER: 5 And so, if you -- if you flip over to 6 Number 2, it says you started with -- I think it says 7 you started with you DSC in late November 8 of 2006, late -- late October and early November 9 of 2006; is that --10 Which one --Α. 11 Ο. -- do you see that? 12 Α. No. Let me get to that page. 13 It's Page 4. Ο. 14 Α. Okay. 15 MS. LASKY: It's right here. 16 THE WITNESS: Okay. 17 All right. Now, could you repeat the Α. 18 question? 19 BY MR. MCCARTER: 20 All right. So this -- this language in the 0. 21 middle of Response Number 2 says in late October, 22 early November 2006, and then that's when you 23 executed a DSC note; do you see that? 24 Α. Yes. 25 Q. Okay. Do you recall sort of how your



- 1 relationship with DSC began? Like, how did you
- 2 | find DSC, or how did they find you?
- 3 A. They -- they had a representative at the
- 4 Louisville Auto Auction, Manheim Louisville, and
- 5 he was there, and Scott and I, we just was talking,
- 6 and asked if I'd be interested, and I looked -- he
- 7 | had a brochure, and I looked it over.
- 8 | 0. And what was attractive about that offer?
- 9 A. Just the available money.
- 10 | 0. Do you recall whether the fees and
- 11 | interest were higher, lower than AFC?
- 12 A. Comparable at the time.
- 13 Q. And how about MAFS, how did they
- 14 | compare to MAFS?
- 15 A. Comparable.
- 16 O. Okay. So it was primarily having more
- 17 | credit that attracted you?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. And who was it -- do you remember
- 20 | the name of that representative?
- 21 A. Yes. It's Mark Holley.
- 22 Q. Okay. Do you recall anything more
- 23 | specific about what Mark Holley said to you in that
- 24 | initial meeting?
- 25 A. Nothing. Just basically over the terms



- 1 and the -- the -- how much credit available,
- 2 | interest rate. That was pretty much it.
- 3 Q. Okay. Was there any specific discussion
- 4 | about how interest would be calculated?
- 5 A. I think it was in the -- in the brochure or
- 6 maybe what I signed. It was a percentage plus
- 7 | prime with the prime subject to change.
- 8 Q. Was there any specific discussion about
- 9 when interest would begin to run?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. And so did you meet with anybody else
- 12 | from DSC before you signed up with DSC?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 Q. Did you take the loan forms at that point
- 15 or just a brochure?
- 16 A. First meeting was a brochure, and the
- 17 second he had the forms, and then I signed them.
- 18 O. Okay. So you signed them physically
- 19 present with Mark Holley?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Okay. So your interrogatories say you
- 22 | worked with Mark Holley, Lourdes Givens, and two
- 23 other reps of NextGear at different times.
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Does that sound true?



- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And do -- you don't remember the
- 3 | names of the two --
- 4 A. Well, I do -- after all this, we found a
- 5 | name -- I -- I couldn't think of his name. One of
- 6 | the gentleman's name for NextGear was Art -- Art
- 7 Felix.
- 8 | O. Art Felix.
- 9 A. Art Felix.
- 10 Q. You don't remember the fourth person?
- 11 A. No. I think her name -- no, no. She
- 12 | was -- the situation was Mark Holley got sick.
- 13 They had a couple reps in between there, and then
- 14 | Lourdes Givens was the -- took over.
- 15 O. Okay. So these were -- from your
- 16 perspective anyway, these were NextGear -- I'm
- 17 | sorry, DSC's reps at Manheim Louisville?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. Besides those reps at Manheim
- 20 | Louisville, did you interact with anybody else from
- 21 DSC?
- 22 A. No. No. They -- they would travel to
- 23 different auctions, as well.
- Q. Okay. Do you recall who you interacted
- 25 | with from MAFS?



- 1 A. Donna Kronauer. Is that how -- I don't
- 2 | know how you pronounce that.
- 3 MS. LASKY: Kronauer.
- 4 A. Kronauer. Sorry.
- 5 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 6 Q. Okay.
- 7 A. Excuse me. Kronauer. She was the rep
- 8 | for MAFS.
- 9 O. Okay. I don't think we've seen it in the
- 10 | production, but you don't have the original
- 11 | brochure from DSC that you looked at?
- 12 A. No.
- 0. Okay. And so I'm sorry if this is
- 14 repetitive, but you -- did you interact with DSC at
- 15 | any other auction?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 O. Which one?
- 18 A. Both the representatives, Mark Holley,
- 19 | Lourdes Givens, Art Felix would go to -- I would
- 20 | see them at Louisville, Bowling Green, and
- 21 | Evansville, which would be Wolfes.
- 22 Q. Okay. And so it sounds like they kind of
- 23 | worked that region, that circuit?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Okay. All right. Number 4.



	RED BARN MOTORS vs. COX ENTERPRISES 62
1	A. 4.
2	Q. I'm going to show you what we're going to
3	call Defendants' Exhibit 4, and I'll represent for
4	the record that this is a composite exhibit. It
5	starts with NextGear 003432, but it has various
6	other Bate's numbers included that go through
7	NextGear 003392. They're not all sequential.
8	So again, take as much time as you want, but
9	I'll call your attention to specific questions. I'm
10	not going to ask you to recite the whole document.
11	A. Okay. I'm just going to read that.
12	[examines document]
13	Q. Okay. So Exhibit 4, does this generally
14	look like an application from you to DSC, as well
15	as some other loan agreements you signed with
16	DSC?
17	A. Yes.
18	Q. Okay. And on that first page that's
19	numbered 3432 at the bottom, NextGear 00
20	A. Yes.
21	Q 3432, that is your signature?
22	A. Yes.
23	Q. And it's it's dated October of



Yes.

Α.

of 2006; do you see that?

24

October 19, 2016

1 So do you think this is your first Ο. 2 application --3 Α. I believe so. 4 -- with DSC? Ο. 5 Α. Sorry. I believe so; yes. 6 And at the time, everything on here was Ο. 7 true, to the best of your knowledge? 8 Α. Yes. 9 Ο. Okay. And if you flip over to the second 10 page, it's labeled NextGear 003378; do you see 11 that? 12 Α. Yes. 13 It looks like some sort of follow-up Ο. 14 application or -- that's dated November 2nd, 2006; 15 do you see that? 16 Α. Yes. 17 Do you recall signing that? Ο. 18 Α. Not -- no. 19 Q. Let me ask you: Is that your signature? 20 Α. Yes. 21 Okay. Ο. 22 Α. Yes. 23 And again, you know, this was true, to the Ο. 24 best of your knowledge, at the time?



Yes.

Α.

- Q. Okay. And so then, if we go to the third page of that exhibit that starts at 3379, do you see that?
 - A. Yes.

- Q. That looks like a promissory note you
 signed with DSC on October -- in October of 2006?
- 7 A. Yes.
- Q. And your signature -- that is your signature on 3384?
- 10 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And then the next page, 3385, it's a term sheet dated October 30th, 2006, again, with your signature?
- 14 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And the next few pages, there's a power of attorney, a -- an individual guarantee, an incumbency certificate, corporate resolutions, and then an understanding page. Are all those your signature on those pages?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. And these documents are generally dated in October and November of 2006. So does this look like generally the first batch of documents you signed with DSC?
- 25 A. Yes.



- Q. Okay. Just calling your attention back to the middle, it's labeled 3385, and it's called a
- 3 term sheet.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. All right. In that document, you see
- 6 about four lines down it says program type is
- 7 | retail; do you see that?
- 8 A. Okay. Yes.
- 9 Q. Yeah. Does that mean anything to you?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Okay. If you go on down to the middle of
- 12 | that document, it says [reads] Period: The initial
- 13 term for an Advance under this Note shall be 30
- 14 days and shall mature at that time. All extensions
- 15 | allowed for the same event shall not -- shall be not
- 16 | more than 30 days. Do you see that?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. And then below that, it says, "Extensions:
- 19 The number of Extensions allowed shall be 2."
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Does that refresh your memory about, you
- 22 know, when a car payment would be due and how
- 23 | many times you could extend it?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. Okay. And is -- is that accurate? You



1 had 30 days to pay it, but you could extend it 2 twice? 3 Α. Yes. 4 And of course, if you sold it before Ο. 5 that, you'd have to pay it off; right? 6 Α. Yes. 7 Okay. Okay. All right. Show you a Q. 8 couple more documents. We're on Number 6, I 9 think. 10 MS. LASKY: Number 5. 11 MR. MCCARTER: Number 5; okay. 12 THE WITNESS: I have two 4s. 13 MS. LASKY: Oh. 14 MR. MCCARTER: Uh-oh. 15 THE WITNESS: Let me see what we've 16 got here. This is 1. 17 MR. MCCARTER: Let's go off the record 18 for a second. 19 [WHEREUPON, a brief recess is taken.] 20 [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked Defendants' Exhibit 5 for identification. 21 22 BY MR. MCCARTER: 23 Okay. Mr. Mattingly, did my error that 24 the exhibit we just talked about that contained the application and initial batch of loan documents will 25



- 1 be labeled Exhibit Number 5; do you see that?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And you agree with that?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Okay. And so now I'm going to show you
- 6 | the next exhibit, which we're going to call Exhibit
- 7 Number 6.
- 8 | [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked
- 9 Defendants' Exhibit 6 for identification.
- 10 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 11 Q. And again, this is a composite exhibit
- 12 | with different term sheets in it, and some of them
- were produced by you, and some of them were
- 14 produced by NextGear; do you see those?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 0. And is it accurate to say that each of
- 17 | those have your signature on them?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. And do you have any reason to
- 20 doubt that these are the term sheets that applied
- 21 | to your DSC line of credit at -- at the dates
- 22 | indicated on these term sheets?
- 23 | A. Yes.
- O. You have a reason to doubt that?
- 25 A. Oh, I'm sorry. Yes, they are correct.



October 19, 2016 68

- 1 0. Okay.
- 2 A. Sorry.

- Q. Just because I asked the question
- 4 | backwards. These are term sheets you signed with
- 5 DSC that controlled at the time they say they
- 6 | controlled?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 MS. LASKY: Objection to the form.
- 9 A. Yeah, they look to be accurate.
- 10 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 11 Q. Okay. I'm going to show you what we're
- 12 | going to call Defendants' Exhibit 7.
- 13 | [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked]
- 14 Defendants' Exhibit 7 for identification.
- 15 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 16 O. Again, this is another composite exhibit
- 17 that starts with NextGear 3394, but it has some
- 18 documents that you produced and some that we
- 19 | produced. It includes a power of attorney, indiv --
- 20 | individual personal quarantee, and a few other
- 21 documents.
- 22 I just wanted you to confirm that those are
- 23 | your signatures again.
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. I'm going to show you what we're



- 1 going to call Exhibit 8.
- 2 [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked
- 3 | Defendants' Exhibit 8 for identification.]
- 4 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 5 O. This document, it's Bate's labeled
- 6 MA 000022 through MA 34. Do you see that at the
- 7 | bottom?
- 8 | A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Okay. And this looks like a promissory
- 10 | note that you signed with DSC in February, on
- 11 | February 5th, 2009; does that look accurate to you?
- 12 | You can look at Page 30.
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Okay. And Page 31 has a power of
- 15 | attorney?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 Q. And Page 33 is a term sheet?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And again, those are your signatures on
- 20 | the power of attorney and the term sheet?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. All right. And then Page 34 is a credit
- 23 | limit amendment to demand promissory note and
- 24 | security agreement; do you see that?
- 25 A. Yes.



October 19, 2016 70

Q. And that's your signature?

A. Yes.

- 3 Q. Okay. I mean, this generally looks like a
- 4 batch of loan documents you signed in October
- 5 of 2011; does that look right?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Do you believe this is the last set of loan
- 8 documents you signed with DSC?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Okay. And there are handwritten notes
- 11 on this document, and I'll represent to you that
- 12 | this document was produced by you to us. Do you
- 13 | know whose handwriting that is?
- 14 A. You know what, no, I don't.
- 15 O. Okay. Is it yours?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 | 0. Would you recognize it if it was your
- 18 | wife's?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Is it hers?
- 21 A. Oh, no.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. Way not neat enough.
- 24 Q. Do you recall whether the handwriting
- 25 | was on there when you produced it to your



1	attorney?	
---	-----------	--

- 2 A. No, I don't.
- 3 Q. Okay. So these loan documents we just
- 4 | looked at, Exhibits 6, 7, 8, was it your
- 5 understanding they governed the legal terms of
- 6 | your arrangement with DSC?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Okay. Are you aware of any other legal
- 9 agreements that you had with DSC besides the
- 10 ones we've looked at?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. And you know, we talked about this
- 13 generically with floor plans earlier, but was your
- 14 understanding that in exchange for DSC's money
- 15 | you would have to pay that money back plus
- 16 | interest and fees?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 O. Okay. And you understood they had a
- 19 | security interest in your cars to secure payment?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. Okay. Did you always pay DSC by ACH?
- 22 A. I think at first Mark Holley would come
- 23 down to auctions if I called him early before -- I
- 24 | think even before they had their website, I could
- 25 | call him and tell him that I was going to be at the



- 1 auction, need to pay off a particular vehicle, and I
 2 would give him a check. He worked out of
- 3 Lexington.
- 4 Q. And he'd hand you the title?
- A. He'd hand me the title, and I'd hand him
- 6 | the check.
- 7 Q. Okay. And I should have asked this
- 8 before, but that would generally mean that DSC
- 9 | would hold the titles after you floored the car with
- 10 | them until they were paid?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And is that true of other floor plans?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Okay. And that's sort of part of their
- 15 | security to make sure they get paid?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 O. Do you -- do you have any knowledge of
- 18 | while they were holding those titles whose name
- 19 | the vehicle be titled in?
- 20 MS. LASKY: Object to the --
- 21 A. No.
- 22 MS. LASKY: -- form.
- 23 A. No.
- 24 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 25 Q. During that period you were with



- 1 DSC, 2006 to 2012, how did you keep your books
- 2 | internally at Mattingly, if any?
- 3 A. Well, I would -- I don't know that I
- 4 understand the question.
- 5 Q. Okay. So presumably, you keep some
- 6 accounting record of some sort of what you paid
- 7 | for a car, how much you sell it for, that sort of
- 8 | thing?
- 9 A. Yes. We'd have something from --
- 10 | familiar -- we called it the manilla -- the binders,
- 11 | and we have ve -- all the -- everything related to
- 12 | that car in that particular binder.
- 13 Q. Okay. Is that --
- 14 A. Auction ticket.
- 15 Q. Have you heard the term deal jacket? Is
- 16 | it kind of the same thing?
- 17 | A. Yeah, jacket. A jacket; yes.
- 18 Q. Okay.
- 19 A. Thank you for that term. I knew it, but I
- 20 | just couldn't -- it was on the tip of my tongue.
- 21 Q. No problem. But at some point when
- 22 | you've got to file your taxes, I guess, you've got
- 23 | to translate that to profit or loss; right?
- 24 A. Correct.
- 25 Q. How do you do that?



- A. Well, we just -- we -- actually, my wife puts them into the computer --
 - Q. Uh-huh.

- A. -- and we just calculate every one of them

 at -- at the end of the day when it was sold. We
- 6 knew on that vehicle what the profit or loss was.
- 7 Q. Okay. Do you know during 2006, 2012,
- 8 | were you using a particular software to do that?
- 9 A. No, I don't -- I don't know.
- 10 Q. You may have been, you just don't know?
- 11 A. Yeah. There was something, but I don't
- 12 | know what it would be.
- 0. Okay. But as -- as far as you know, you
- 14 | didn't attempt to track how much interest and fees
- 15 | would be due to NextGear during that period? You
- 16 | just looked at their online statement for that?
- 17 A. Yes. And we could do it the end of the
- 18 | year statement, as well. There was an end of the
- 19 | year statement they could pull.
- 20 Q. From NextGear?
- 21 A. From NextGear.
- 22 Q. Okay. And when I say NextGear in those
- 23 | last two questions, we're talking about DSC; right?
- 24 A. DSC; yes.
- 25 Q. Okay. So we talked about, you know,



- 1 your initial discussion with Mark Holley, and you
- 2 | said there was no specific discussion about the
- 3 | timing of interest, when it would start accruing;
- 4 right?
- 5 A. Correct.
- 6 Q. Did you ever talk about that issue with
- 7 anybody at DSC?
- 8 A. Possibly. I -- I just don't remember.
- 9 Q. As we sit here today, you don't remember
- 10 any specific conversations with anybody at DSC
- 11 | about when DSC would start charging interest?
- 12 A. Well, occasionally, they -- if I was --
- 13 | can -- can I give you an example?
- 14 O. Yeah.
- 15 A. If I bought a car today, and let's say I
- 16 | sold it next week, and I paid it off online, there
- 17 | would -- and I -- and when they -- when I check,
- 18 | there's no title available. So they basically didn't
- 19 | have the title yet, but yet I was still paying the
- 20 | interest, and they didn't even have the title.
- 21 So I would have to wait until they got the title
- 22 | to send to me. Other than that, that would be
- 23 | about the only thing.
- Q. But did you -- do you remember talking to
- 25 | somebody at NextGear about that?



- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. And who was that?
- 3 A. That would be both Mark Holley, as well
- 4 as -- mostly, Lourdes Givens.
- 5 Q. Okay. And what did you say to them
- 6 | about it?
- 7 A. Just in a -- I said in a jokingly -- I'm sure
- 8 | that they told me it was common practice, but I
- 9 said, "That's kind of a shame that I'm paying
- 10 | interest on something that you-all are still holding
- 11 | the money on that I don't even have yet."
- 12 Q. M-hm. But do you remember any specific
- discussions with anybody at DSC about when
- 14 | interest would start accruing on your floor plan
- 15 | cars in the first place?
- 16 A. Other than --
- 17 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 18 A. Other than that, no.
- 19 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 20 Q. Okay. All right. I'm going to show what
- 21 | we're going to call Defendants' Exhibit 9.
- 22 | [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked
- 23 | Defendants' Exhibit 9 for identification.]
- 24 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 25 Q. This document is Bate's labeled MA 252



through 283. Do you see that at the bottom? 1 2 see those numbers --3 Α. Yes. 4 Ο. -- right? 5 Α. I'm sorry. 6 252 --Ο. 7 Yes. Yes. Α. I'm sorry. 8 No problem. And I'll represent to you 0. 9 that MA generally means it's a document that you 10 produced to us. So is -- do you recognize this 11 document? 12 Α. It looks like a sheet; yes. 13 Does it -- well, it -- it starts with Ο. 14 Manheim Automotive Financial Services, Inc. 15 Security Agreement, Inventory Financing bridge 16 Line of Credit; do you see that? 17 Α. Yes. 18 Is it fair to say this is All right. 19 generally the loan agreements you signed with 20 MAFS in -- in July of 2010? 21 Α. It looks like the typical -- typical 22 thing; yes. 23 And those are your signatures 24 internally, like, for example, on 2 -- Page 272

and 275?

October 19, 2016

	RED BARN	N MOTORS vs. COX ENTERPRISES	78
1	Α.	Yes.	
2	Q.	Okay. And that's your signature on 279?	
3	A.	Yes.	
4	Q.	And 283?	
5	Α.	Yes.	
6	Q.	Okay. So, after July 2010, this would	
7	genera	ally be the loan agreements that would	
8	govern	n your floor plan with MAFS?	
9	Α.	Yes.	
10	Q.	Okay.	
11		MR. MCCARTER: What number are we	
12	on?		
13		THE WITNESS: Number 10 will be the	
14	next o	one.	
15	[WHERE	EUPON, document referred to is marked	
16	Defend	dants' Exhibit 10 for identification.]	
17	BY MR	. MCCARTER:	
18	Q.	All right. I'm going to show you what	
19	we're	going to call Defendant's Exhibit 10. This	is
20	Bate's	s labeled MA 242 through 244. This is called	
21	"MAFS	Floor Plan Guideline"; do you see that?	
22	А.	Yes.	
23	Q.	And is that your signature on the second	
2.4			



Yes.

page?

Α.

24

October 19, 2016 79

- 1 So these are generally guidelines Ο. Okav. 2 for the MAFS line around the time you signed this? 3 Α. Yes. 4 And at a high level do you 5 understand that part of your complaint in this case 6 relates to when interest began accruing on your 7 DSC line? 8 Α. Yeah. 9 0. Okay. Can you give me your 10 understanding of what your concern is? 11 I believe they were -- basically when I Α. 12 bought a car title attached or title absent, it 13 appears that they were writing -- charging me 14 interest from Day 1, and MAFS was even charging 15 me interest, two -- two days worth of interest the 16 day I put it on the floor plan. 17 So on the DSC side, is your only concern 18 the cars that were sold title absent? 19 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 20 Α. Possibly. I believe so.
- 21 BY MR. MCCARTER:

22

23

24

25

Q. Okay. So if the title is present on the day of the auction, you believe it would be appropriate for DSC to start charging interest from that day?



October 19, 2016 80

1 1	7\	Voa
1 1	Δ	Y (2) (3)

- Q. Okay. And on MAFS, you believe it would
- 3 be appropriate for MAFS to start charging interest
- 4 | from the day of sale if title was present?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Okay. Do you believe your MAFS line of
- 7 | credit and your MAFS documents are at issue in
- 8 | this case?
- 9 A. I'm sorry. Repeat that.
- 10 Q. Do you believe your MAFS line of credit
- 11 | separate from your DSC --
- 12 A. M-hm.
- 13 Q. -- line of credit is at issue in this case?
- 14 A. Possibly; yes.
- 15 O. So on the -- step back to the cars that
- 16 | were sold title absent. So if you bought a title
- 17 | absent car and you put it on your DSC line, your
- 18 position is that interest would start being charged
- 19 | from the day of sale?
- 20 A. Correct.
- 21 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 22 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 23 Q. Okay. And is it your position that you
- 24 | think it was only appropriate to charge it once title
- 25 | was present?



- 1 A. Yes.
- 2 Q. But in that period between when you
- 3 | purchased it and when the title showed up, where
- 4 | was the car?
- 5 A. Usually at my lot unless I had it sold.
- 6 Q. And so you would be able to go ahead and
- 7 take the car that day from auction, you just
- 8 | wouldn't have the title until later?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Okay. And is it -- do you have a -- strike
- 11 | that.
- 12 You'd said earlier that you -- you'd always
- 13 have to make some part of payment or arrangement
- 14 | for payment with the auction to take the car; right?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 | O. Do you believe the auction would have let
- 17 | you take the car sold title absent without you
- 18 | putting it on the DSC line?
- 19 | A. I could --
- 20 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 21 A. I'm not sure if I understand the question.
- 22 | I couldn't leave the auction until that car was
- 23 | signed for by either paid for or by -- if it was a
- 24 | floor plan, somebody has to initial it and scan it
- 25 | in.



October 19, 2016 82

	RED BARRING TORO VS. GOX ENTERT RIGES	02
1	BY MR. MCCARTER:	
2	Q. Okay. But you were able to take the cars	
3	put on the DSC line because you told the auction	
4	you were putting on the DSC line?	
5	A. Yes.	
6	Q. Okay. And that's true whether the title is	
7	present or not?	
8	A. Yes.	
9	Q. Okay. Let me show what you we're going	
10	to call Exhibit 11.	
11	[WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked	
12	Defendants' Exhibit 11 for identification.]	
13	BY MR. MCCARTER:	
14	Q. And this document is Bate's labeled	
15	MA 306 through 309. So this was produced to	
16	you I mean, by you to us in this case. Do you	
17	recognize this document?	
18	A. Yes. It looks like a dealer statement	
19	document from DSC.	
20	Q. Okay. And if you you can see it was	
21	printed on on in the I guess, let's see, this	S
22	is the second page of the exhibit. You can see a	
23	printed date of Monday, January 11th, 2010 at 4:45	
24	p.m.; do you see that?	



Yes.

Α.

October 19, 2016

1 And then it -- it's got a start date of -- on 2 the left-hand side from January 1st, 2009 through December 31st, 2009; do you see that? 3 4 Α. Yes. 5 Ο. Would this be that sort of year end 6 statement you were talking about? 7 Α. Yes. Yes. Yeah. Correct. 8 And so is this something you could go 0. 9 online and get from DSC and then print on your 10 end? 11 Α. Yes. It looks like there's a fax line at 12 Ο. 13 the top of the document on each page; do you see 14 that? 15 Where -- if you could point it out to me? Α. 16 Ο. Yeah. 17 This. MS. LASKY: 18 BY MR. MCCARTER: 19 Q. Right there. 20 Α. Oh, okay. Yes. I'm sorry. 21 0. Do you --22 Α. Yes. 23 -- see that? Ο. 24 Α. Yes.

And it -- it shows a fax date of



Q.

- 1 | January 11th, 2010, and it's got a fax number, and
- 2 | then it says "Dealer Services Corporation." Do
- 3 | you read that as a document faxed to you by DSC
- 4 or from you to DSC?
- 5 A. From DSC to us.
- 6 Q. Okay. Yet -- I mean, I know you -- you
- 7 | probably don't remember, but do you have any
- 8 | reason to doubt it was faxed to you by DSC on
- 9 January 11th, 2010?
- 10 | A. No, I don't.
- 11 Q. Okay. And do you read this sort of as all
- 12 | the cars financed during that period and the total
- 13 | due and paid on those?
- 14 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 15 A. It appears so, as well as where it also
- 16 | has collateral audits, as well.
- 17 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 18 Q. Okay. The top of Page 2?
- 19 A. Yes, it does, and I -- apparently, I missed
- 20 | something here. It appears that they charged me
- 21 | two lot audits in the same month. I must have
- 22 | missed that.
- 23 | Q. Okay. And you didn't have two lots?
- 24 A. No. It looks like they charged me on
- 25 | the 22nd, and another 75 on the 23rd.



- Page 452 and 453, it's the last two pages in that exhibit; do you see that?

 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. And this document looks like it's called
- 5 | "Receivable Detail Report"?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And it's got a date of 5/23/2012?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Do you have any sense of what this is and
- 10 | what it shows?
- 11 | A. This is --
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 13 A. This is the final -- this is the final cars
- 14 | that we had with DSC.
- 15 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 16 Q. Okay. And you -- you had possession of
- 17 this. Do you recall how you got possession of it?
- 18 A. I'm sure it was off the website.
- 19 Q. Okay. You know, it shows 120,311.28
- 20 outstanding at that point. Do you see in the
- 21 | middle?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Do you -- do you know whether Mattingly
- 24 ever paid that to DSC?
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.



- 2 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 3 Q. No, you didn't pay it?
- 4 A. Did not; no.
- 5 Q. Okay. And however -- why did you not
- 6 pay it?
- 7 A. Excuse me?
- 8 Q. Why did you not pay that?
- 9 A. These cars were involved in the
- 10 repossession. Some of them were. Some of them
- 11 | were already paid off or sold. Sorry. Sold.
- 12 Q. And so do you have some recollection
- 13 | that some cars were resold and reduced that
- 14 | amount?
- 15 A. We had -- we had actually -- several of
- 16 | these cars were ours that we paid off ourselves,
- 17 | and some of them went to repossession.
- 18 Q. Okay. Do you recall whether there was a
- 19 deficiency on the repossessed cars?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 Q. And was that paid?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 | Q. Okay. All right. At some point, I think
- 24 | you said this already, DSC declared a default and
- 25 | picked up cars?



|--|

- Q. Okay. And what's your recollection of --
- 3 of when that happened?
- 4 A. May the 9th of 2012.
- 5 Q. Okay. Do you recall any discussions with
- 6 DSC at the time about why they did that?
- 7 A. No, they did not. No reason.
- 8 Q. No reason. Did -- did you have any
- 9 problems with MAFS around the same time?
- 10 A. No.

- 11 O. No. Did MAFS ever declare default?
- 12 A. Yes, at the same -- they did it at the
- 13 | same time.
- 14 Q. Did they pick up cars?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. Okay.
- 17 A. No. I -- no. I only took one back to
- 18 them.
- 19 Q. Okay. So you voluntarily returned one to
- 20 MAFS after they declared a default?
- 21 A. Yes, involuntarily [phonetic]. The
- 22 remainder of DCS, as well.
- Q. So DSC picked up some cars
- 24 involuntarily, you returned others?
- 25 A. Yes.



- Q. Okay. And both of those things happened in May of 2012?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Okay. Did you have any -- do you recall
- 5 | whether the AFC line was still out -- or still
- 6 | existing at that time?
- 7 A. It was not.
- 8 Q. Was not; okay. Did you have any other
- 9 sources of inventory credit at the time?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Okay. Had you heard anything from the
- 12 | police, the -- the state police you talked about
- 13 | before, before DSC declared its default?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. Just as a general matter apart from DSC,
- 16 | would you ever floor the same car more than once?
- 17 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 18 A. Possibly.
- 19 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 20 Q. Okay. In what circumstances would you
- 21 do that?
- 22 A. If it was in my -- it was my name, I would
- 23 | floor it for -- use the money.
- 24 O. You would floor it and use the money?
- 25 A. Yeah. Floor it, and -- and they would



- 1 pay -- give me -- send me a check or whatever.
- 2 Q. So if -- was there ever a situation where
- 3 | you bought it at auction, put it on a floor plan, and
- 4 then, at some point, you re-floored the same car
- 5 | with another --
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. -- company? When would that happen?
- 8 A. If it ran over in time, and generally it was
- 9 done by Donna, or Lourdes would do it for me.
- 10 Q. Okay. And how did they value the car at
- 11 | that time? How much -- how did they value how
- 12 | much to finance at that time?
- 13 A. I --
- 14 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 15 A. They would -- I quess they would use a --
- 16 | they had a chart, or they had the auction ticket
- 17 | where I purchased it.
- 18 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 19 Q. Okay. Did you ever use the original
- 20 | auction ticket to floor it a second time?
- 21 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 22 A. No. No, I don't believe so. Unless it
- 23 | was -- unless Donna changed the -- I think one
- 24 | instance I just saw some of the paperwork where
- 25 | Donna changed it from MAFS to DSC.



	KED BAKIN	WOTORS VS. COX ENTERPRISES	<u></u>
1	BY MR.	MCCARTER:	
2	Q.	Did you ever sell a car at auction or	
3	online	, like on you know OVE, Online Vehicle	
4	Exchan	ge?	
5	A.	M-hm.	
6	Q.	Okay. Did you ever sell a car at an	
7	auctio	n or on OVE to another dealer at a	
8	pre-ar	ranged price?	
9		MS. LASKY: Object to the form.	
10	A.	No.	
11	BY MR.	MCCARTER:	
12	Q.	Did you ever buy a car at an auction or on	
13	OVE fr	om another dealer at a pre-arranged price?	
14	A.	Yes.	
15	Q.	Okay. When would that happen?	
16	A.	I I don't recall dates.	
17	Q.	And then did you ever put that car, those	
18	cars o	n the floor plan?	
19	Α.	Yes.	
20	Q.	With DSC?	
21	Α.	Yes.	
22	Q.	Do you do you think that's proper to	
23	financ	e a car like that with a floor plan?	
24		MS. LASKY: Object to the form.	

It would have to be, because they did it



October 19, 2016

1 for me. 2 BY MR. MCCARTER: 3 0. Okay. But in that situation, you're using 4 a pre-arranged non-auction price, and you're 5 representing to a floor planner that that's the 6 auction price; right? 7 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. I'm not sure of your question, but I can 8 Α. 9 say that -- they would have to be a certain -- the --10 the vehicle price would have to meet certain 11 quidelines, and that would be set by Donna, and 12 Lourdes would know that. 13 BY MR. MCCARTER: 14 Okay. But if they're -- if they're typically 15 financing the auction price and relying on the 16 auction to set the value and you've preset that 17 value with a dealer unbeknownst to the floor 18 planner, would that be a misrepresentation to the 19 floor planner? 20 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 21 Α. No, because they -- they -- they wouldn't 22 allow an overpriced car on the floor plan. 23 BY MR. MCCARTER: 24 How do you -- how do you know Ο. Okay. 25 How do you know what DSC would finance?



- 1 A. Well, they'd have a -- they have
- 2 | guidelines. I -- I don't know their -- what they call
- 3 | it. Manheim has an MMR. It's an average market
- 4 price of a vehicle.
- 5 Q. Do you know for a fact that DSC used
- 6 | that?
- 7 A. No, I don't. I'm -- I'm not sure what they
- 8 used.
- 9 Q. Okay. How often do you think that
- 10 | happened where you would sell a car at an auction
- 11 on -- I'm sorry, buy a car at auction on an OVE at
- 12 | a pre-arranged price?
- 13 A. Oh, I --
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 15 A. I don't have a number. I don't have --
- 16 | wouldn't have a number for you.
- 17 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 18 Q. More than ten?
- 19 A. I'd say -- oh, yeah, possibly. Ten or so.
- 20 Q. Ten or so?
- 21 A. M-hm.
- 22 Q. Okay. Did you ever -- while you were
- 23 | with DSC, did you ever obtain duplicate titles?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q. Never?



- 1 A. No.
- 2 Q. Okay. Do -- do you have an
- 3 understanding what title washing is?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. Okay. Did you ever apply for or obtain a
- 6 | title that removed an owner or a lienholder from
- 7 | the titles without having paid off that owner or
- 8 | lienholder?
- 9 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 10 A. No.
- 11 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 12 Q. Okay. During these de -- the default time
- 13 | frame with DSC, did you close your line with them,
- 14 or did they close it?
- 15 A. I guess they closed it, because they cut
- 16 us off with them a couple of weeks after that.
- 17 | That -- that printout you had was for our last
- 18 statement.
- 19 Q. Okay. Did they leave you on sale only for
- 20 | a little bit?
- 21 A. No.
- 22 Q. Okay. What about MAFS, did you close
- 23 | that, or did MAFS close it?
- A. Once we defaulted, I guess we both
- 25 | closed it. I -- there was no arrangement. I just



- was barred from the auction.Q. Okay. You said you were barred from the
- 3 auction. Which auction are you talking about?
- 4 A. Manheim.
- 5 Q. Okay. And you had an understanding
- 6 prior to 2012 that MAFS was affiliated with
- 7 | Manheim?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And was it your understanding that prior
- 10 to 2012 MAFS and DSC were not affiliated?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 | O. And so DSC was not affiliated with
- 13 | Manheim?
- 14 A. Yes, I believe so.
- 15 Q. Okay. So, prior to 2012, did you have
- 16 an understanding that DSC and MAFS were
- 17 | competitors?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. Do you know whether DSC was
- 20 affiliated, like, connected by corporate ownership
- 21 | with any particular auction company?
- 22 A. No, I wouldn't have any idea.
- Q. Okay. So around the time that DSC
- 24 declared its default, do you remember whether
- 25 | they did a lot audit?



- 1 A. They did a lot audit; yes. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And did they find cars not
- 3 | present?
- 4 A. Yes. Well, they found all cars, but
- 5 | they -- some of them were at different places in
- 6 town, and I took them to all those.
- 7 Q. But that -- that happened over the next
- 8 | few days; right?
- 9 A. It was prior, prior to the repossession.
- 10 Q. Okay. So they did a lot audit, not all
- 11 | cars were on your lot; right?
- 12 A. Basically, yes.
- Q. And over the next few days, you helped
- 14 | them locate each of those cars?
- 15 A. No, no. The same day.
- 16 O. Same day; okay. And where were the
- 17 other cars?
- 18 A. One was in a garage, and the other one
- 19 | was at a salesman's house.
- 20 Q. What were they doing there?
- 21 A. One was just in a garage because it was
- 22 | a BMW, and the other one was --
- 23 | THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. It was being
- 24 | what?
- 25 THE WITNESS: It was a BMW.



October 19, 2016

	RED BARN MOTORS vs. COX ENTERPRISES	99
1	THE REPORTER: Thank you.	
2	THE WITNESS: Sorry.	
3	A. And the other was the guy was driving	
4	it.	
5	BY MR. MCCARTER:	
6	Q. Did you have any understanding that the	
7	inventory was supposed to remain on your lot until	
8	it was sold?	
9	A. No.	
10	Q. Were any of the cars out with retail	
11	customers when MAFS was I'm sorry, when DSC	
12	was looking for them?	
13	A. Yes, there was one. One.	
14	Q. Had it been sold?	
15	A. It had been sold and waiting to transfer.	
16	Q. When you say waiting to transfer, does	
17	that mean to provide title to the buyer?	
18	A. Yes. To transfer it because they had	
19	already paid for it, and it was	
20	Q. And you didn't have the title yet because	
21	you hadn't paid DSC for it?	
22	A. Right.	
23	Q. Okay. Do you recall at all the gap in time	
24	there as between when you sold it to the retail	

customer versus when DSC came looking for it?



I don't remember the exact 1 No, I don't. 2 dates and times, but I -- I know who I sold it to 3 and -- a good friend of mine. Okay. Was it beyond the -- the 24-hour 4 5 period you had to pay DSC? 6 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 7 Yes, because I was holding a check for a Α. 8 customer. 9 BY MR. MCCARTER: 10 Okay. So at that point, you had sold a car retail, and you hadn't paid DSC for it within 11 12 the required time frame? 13 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 14 Α. Right. BY MR. MCCARTER: 15 16 Ο. Okay. Have you ever signed a title for 17 someone else that you provided to DSC for floor 18 planning? 19 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 20 Α. I -- I don't understand the question about 21 what you're --BY MR. MCCARTER: 22 Have you ever signed anyone else's name 23

to a -- the title to a vehicle you put on the DSC

floor plan?

24

- 1 A. Not that I recall; hm-m.
- Q. And have you ever duplicated a title to a
- 3 | vehicle that you put on the DSC floor plan?
- 4 A. Duplicated? No. I had original titles.
- 5 Q. And by duplicating, we understand that
- 6 | that means going to the state to get another title;
- 7 | right?
- 8 A. Unless it was put in Mattingly Auto Sales'
- 9 name, if that's what you're talking about.
- 10 Q. So I just want to make sure you -- you
- 11 | didn't -- you never got a duplicate title from the
- 12 state on a car that you had already put on the DSC
- 13 | floor plan?
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 15 A. I don't -- I don't know.
- 16 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 17 Q. You don't have any --
- 18 A. That one I would not -- I don't know. I
- 19 | don't have an answer to that one.
- 20 Q. Did you ever present a duplicate title to
- 21 | DSC to floor plan a car when you had already sold
- 22 | the car and passed on the original title to someone
- 23 | else?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q. Okay. Have you ever moved vehicles to



1	avoid DSC repossessing them?	
2	A. Yes.	
3	Q. Okay. Can you tell me about that?	
4	A. When they we moved our vehicles the	
5	day that they came in for repossession. We didn't	
6	know what was going on, because we we did not	
7	have any contact, we were not in contact with	
8	Lourdes would would not return our calls.	
9	Q. M-hm.	
10	A. To protect ourselves, we moved vehicles,	
11	a few of them.	
12	Q. Where did you move them to?	
13	A. A friend of mine's property.	
14	Q. Who was that?	
15	A. Thornhill Equipment.	
16	THE REPORTER: What was it?	
17	THE WITNESS: Thornhill	
18	THE REPORTER: Thank you.	
19	THE WITNESS: Equipment.	
20	BY MR. MCCARTER:	
21	Q. Were all of those vehicles that you moved	
22	eventually returned to DSC?	
23	A. Yes, every one of them.	
24	Q. Okay. Have you ever moved cars to	
25	prevent MAFS or AFC from repossessing?	



1	Α.	No.
2		MS. LASKY: I'm sorry. Can we take a
3	break?	
4		MR. MCCARTER: Absolutely.
5		MS. LASKY: Okay.
6	[WHEREUPON, a brief recess is taken.]	
7	BY MR.	MCCARTER:
8	Q.	All right. I just want to clear up a couple
9	of thir	ngs we heard earlier. You you mentioned
10	an Art	Felix that you may have dealt with at
11	A.	Yes.
12	Q.	DSC?
13	A.	Yes.
14	Q.	Do you recall that?
15	A.	Yes.
16	Q.	Is it possible Mr. Felix was with AFC?
17	A.	No, he was Dealer Services.
18	Q.	You're sure.
19	A.	Yeah.
20	Q.	Okay.
21	A.	Yes.
22	Q.	And you mentioned an auction at Bowling
23	Green.	Is that ABC Bowling Green?
24	A.	Yes.
25	Q.	Okay.



- 1 A. One other thing. Can I throw this in?
- 2 | This document on 307 on Exhibit Number 11 --
- 3 | Q. Okay.
- 4 A. -- I mean, this was the -- this was a --
- 5 | let's see if this is the right one. No, that's not.
- 6 I'm sorry. That's the wrong one [examines
- 7 document1.
- 8 Yeah, I'm sorry. It's 452. That was not
- 9 requested by us. We -- we were at that time
- 10 | locked out of the -- DSC's website.
- 11 Q. Okay.
- 12 A. That was requested, I guess, by that
- 13 Kevin Fredericks.
- 14 Q. Who's --
- 15 A. This is --
- 16 | O. -- Kevin Fredericks?
- 17 A. He's something to do with DSC. I'm not
- 18 | sure of his title.
- 19 Q. Well how did you get it and produce to
- 20 us?
- 21 A. To be honest with you, I don't know.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. I don't recall.
- Q. Okay. And how did you come to this new
- 25 | knowledge during our break?



- 1 A. My wife ref -- talked to me.
- Q. Okay. That's fine. I just want to make --
- 3 A. Yeah.
- 4 Q. -- sure you know --
- 5 A. Yeah, right.
- 6 Q. -- you're not supposed to be talking to
- 7 anybody else during the break. You can talk to
- 8 | your attorney, obviously, but you're not supposed
- 9 to change your testimony and talk to people about
- 10 | how to testify during the break. So just next time
- 11 | let's be careful about that.
- 12 | A. Okay.
- 13 Q. Okay.
- MS. LASKY: Well, I would just -- as
- 15 | a 30(b)(6), he does have the obligation to educate
- 16 | himself, so --
- 17 MR. MCCARTER: Before the deposition,
- 18 | yes, not during the deposition.
- 19 MS. LASKY: Okay.
- 20 THE WITNESS: Okay.
- 21 MR. MCCARTER: Okay.
- 22 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 23 | Q. All right. So we were -- so you've got a
- 24 | blacklisting allegation in this case, too.
- 25 A. Yes.



- 1 O. Do you know that?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay. What -- what is your understanding
- 4 of your concern about blacklisting?
- 5 A. They -- after -- did not realize until a few
- 6 | years later that Manheim put us on a K -- with
- 7 Auction Insurance, reported that we did not pay for
- 8 | a vehicle. And they put us in what they call a KO
- 9 Book, which basically means that if I write a check
- 10 to the auction, that they don't insure that check.
- 11 | Q. Who's "they"?
- 12 A. Auction Insurance.
- 13 Q. Okay.
- 14 A. Auction Insurance will not insure the
- 15 check. I found this out from Wolfe's Auto Auction.
- 16 Q. Okay. So it's your understanding that
- 17 | Manheim put you in the --
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. -- this KO Book?
- 20 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And that's not DSC?
- 22 A. Well, it was -- actually, at the time it was
- 23 NextGear.
- 24 O. Okay.
- 25 A. Well no, actually, it was Manheim. It was



- 1 | actually Manheim, from my understanding. Now I
- 2 do not know that. That's what one of the guys at
- 3 | the auction told me.
- 4 Q. Okay. So your knowledge is based on
- 5 | something you heard at Wolfe's Auto Auction.
- 6 A. That's when I first heard it, and I actually
- 7 | called them.
- 8 | O. Called who?
- 9 A. Called Auction Insurance. And they said
- 10 | I was in the KO Book because I didn't -- and they
- 11 | wouldn't give me much more details other than I
- 12 | didn't pay for a vehicle.
- 13 O. At Manheim.
- 14 A. At Manheim.
- 15 | O. Okay.
- 16 A. Which was part of the bankruptcy, so it
- 17 | was discharged.
- 18 Q. Okay. We'll come to the bankruptcy in a
- 19 | second.
- 20 A. Okay.
- 21 | Q. All right. So I'll -- you can turn to it, if
- 22 | you want, or I'll just read it to you. These are in
- 23 | the interrogatories, which I think --
- 24 A. The fir -- the first --
- 25 Q. Number 4, maybe, Exhibit Number 4.



October 19, 2016 108

1	7\	IJh-huh.
1	I A	un-nun.

- Q. And at Response Number 15, which is on
- 3 | Page 12 and 13, at -- at the end of that it says,
- 4 | "Further responding, Mr. Mattingly was informed by
- 5 | Carol Gardner with Wolfe's Auto Auction that
- 6 | Mattingly Auto Sales was listed in the KO Book
- 7 | compiled and issued by Auction Insurance
- 8 | Agency." Do you see that?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 | 0. And is that accurate?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 | 0. Okay. So who's Carol Gardner?
- 13 A. She is -- she works for Wolfe's Auto
- 14 | Auction. I don't know her official titles, but she
- 15 | works for Wolfe -- Wolfe's Auto Action.
- 16 | 0. Is she a manager there?
- 17 A. Yes, of some capacity, but --
- 18 Q. Not the --
- 19 A. -- what exactly I do not know.
- 20 O. But not the --
- 21 A. She's not an owner.
- 22 Q. Not the general manager?
- 23 A. No.
- 24 Q. Okay. And you said -- I think you said it
- 25 | basically means Auction Insurance Agency won't



- 1 insure your checks.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay. And -- but you'd testified earlier
- 4 | that you are able to write checks at Wolfe's
- 5 | Evansville and Clark County; right?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. All right. And do you know -- do you
- 8 | know what connection, if any, Auction Insurance
- 9 Agency has to Manheim?
- 10 A. I have -- no, I wouldn't have any idea.
- 11 Q. Do you know if any -- what connection it
- 12 | has to NextGear?
- 13 A. No, I wouldn't have any idea.
- 14 0. Okav. And earlier in that same
- 15 | Interrogatory Number 15 it says, "Subject to the
- 16 | foregoing specific and general objections,
- 17 | Mattingly Auto Group experienced the effects of
- 18 | blacklisting' by NextGear/DSC by its inability to
- 19 participate in any auctions at auction houses
- 20 owned by Manheim and by the refusal of other
- 21 | auction houses to extend credit to Mattingly."
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Do you see that?
- 24 A. Yes. Uh-huh. Yes.
- 25 Q. Thank you. And that's true. I mean,



- 1 | that's still your testimony.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay. Do -- do you -- to the extent
- 4 | Manheim -- you believe Manheim put you in the KO
- 5 Book for a non-payment to Manheim, do you have
- 6 any reason to think that's not the reason you can't
- 7 | deal at Manheim?
- 8 A. I believe that is the reason; yes.
- 9 Q. Okay. Okay.
- 10 And this -- this sounds like you can deal at
- 11 | other auction houses; you just don't necessarily
- 12 | get credit from them.
- 13 A. Well, can I give you an example?
- 14 Q. Yeah.
- 15 A. If I bought a vehicle at Wolf -- Wolfe's,
- 16 being as they -- they just flat told me I am a good
- 17 | customer; but I'm -- according to Auction
- 18 Insurance, in that situation I have to write them a
- 19 check that has to clear the bank before I get a
- 20 | title.
- 21 So if I bought one today and the check cleared
- 22 | three days from now, if I needed the title I have to
- 23 drive three hours to get it.
- 24 O. Okay. You can still buy there. You just
- 25 | have to wait a little longer for the title.



- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 Q. Okay.
- 3 A. And at ABC Bowling Green, I talked to the
- 4 | general manager, Jim Dodd. And he would -- he --
- 5 he said if I went in there to even pay in cash, he
- 6 has to get approval. And I haven't talked to him
- 7 | since. I can't even go in there to pay -- pay -- buy
- 8 | a vehicle because of Auction Insurance.
- 9 And ABC Bowling Green, which -- ABC Bowling
- 10 | Green is where I go. So I'm assuming it's all ABC
- 11 | auctions nationwide that I cannot even buy from
- 12 | them even if I pay in cash, \$100 bills cash.
- 13 Q. But I thought -- I thought you said you
- 14 | are doing business at ABC Bowling Green.
- 15 A. No, I -- I'm still go -- I still -- I don't go
- 16 | to that one because it's -- they've changed their
- 17 dates. And I never have pursued it because --
- 18 Q. Okay.
- 19 A. -- I don't ever go to that one.
- 20 Q. All right.
- 21 A. I haven't been since 2012 probably.
- 22 Q. Gotcha. So -- but it was E-town, Clark
- 23 | County, and Wolfe where you do business now?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. And so they clearly have the ability to do



- 1 business with you even if you're in the KO Book.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 | O. Okay. Do you know at all what Auction
- 4 | Insurance Agency is?
- 5 A. It's an insurance agency that insures
- 6 checks for the var -- auc -- auctions all around.
- 7 Q. Okay. Do you know whether every
- 8 | auction in the country uses them as an insurer?
- 9 A. No, I wouldn't have any idea. A lot -- a
- 10 | lot of the big ones do.
- 11 Q. Okay.
- 12 A. I know Wolfe's does. Now, whether
- 13 E-town or Clark County do, I would not have any
- 14 idea.
- 15 | Q. Okay.
- 16 A. I -- even though I've been to those
- 17 | auctions, I probably haven't purchased a vehicle
- 18 | from them in a couple years.
- 19 Q. Okay. And so you said you called Auction
- 20 Insurance Agency to confirm what Wolfe's told you;
- 21 | is that right?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 | 0. And when was that conversation?
- 24 A. That was probably -- I'm going say
- 25 | thir -- 14, 15 possibly.



- 1 0. 2014?
- 2 A. 2014/'15.
- 3 | Q. Okay.
- 4 A. Because I didn't even know it until it was
- 5 | brought up where I bought one at Wolfe's, and they
- 6 | said I -- I had to wait to pick up the title. And I
- 7 | questioned why, and they -- they referred me to
- 8 | Carol Gardner.
- 9 Q. Okay. Oh, so you talked to Auction
- 10 Insurance Agency -- Agency before you talked to
- 11 | Carol?
- 12 A. No, but she was the one that informed me
- 13 | that I -- about this KO Book store [phonetic].
- 14 Q. And that would have happened shortly
- 15 before the conversation with Auction Insurance --
- 16 A. No, I never did talk to Auction Insurance.
- 17 | I talked to Auction Insurance after to find out what
- 18 | was going on. I talked -- Carol Gardner is the one
- 19 | that told me I was in a KO Book.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 A. And then I -- and I had heard ex -- "Well,
- 22 | what is that?" I don't -- you know, didn't know.
- 23 And then I called Auction Insurance, and that's
- 24 | when they informed me it was Manheim; but they
- 25 | had -- wouldn't give me a whole lot of details other



October 19, 2016 114

1 than, "You didn't pay for a vehicle." And they 2 never -- apparently didn't care of my side of the 3 story. 4 But did they mention Manheim? Ο. I believe so; yes. 5 Α. 6 That conversation --Ο. Okay. 7 THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. Mention 8 what? THE WITNESS: 9 Manheim. 10 Manheim. MR. MCCARTER: 11 THE WITNESS: Manheim. Thank you. 12 THE REPORTER: 13 MR. MCCARTER: That's M-a-n-h-e-i-m. 14 BY MR. MCCARTER: 15 They -- but the conversation with Carol Ο. 16 and then the call to Auction Insurance Agency 17 were pretty close in time to one another? 18 It -- the first call to Auction Insurance, Α. 19 yes. 20 Okay. And you think that's 2014/2015? Ο. 21 Two -- yeah, because it was several years Α. 22 before I even realized it. 23 So between 2012 and two 24 thousand -- that call in 2014/2015, you didn't know 25 you were in the KO Book.

- 1 A. Right. Correct.
- 2 Q. Okay. So it -- that means it didn't seem
- 3 | to have any effect on your business during that
- 4 period.
- 5 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 6 A. Well, other than the fact that it would
- 7 have -- it'd be -- it's kind of inconvenient to have
- 8 | to drive for three hours for a title.
- 9 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 10 Q. Okay. Do you have any records from
- 11 | anybody that talk about the KO Book or the in --
- 12 | uninsurable list or. . .
- 13 A. I don't recall. I don't believe so, but I
- 14 don't -- I don't really know.
- 15 | 0. Is it something you searched for to
- 16 | produce in this case?
- 17 A. I don't re -- I don't remember. I do -- I'm
- 18 | going to correct myself. I believe there was a
- 19 | letter from a lawyer that we sent from Stephen
- 20 Hopkins to Auction Insurance questioning that.
- 21 Q. Okay. And do you think you produced it
- 22 | in this case, or not?
- 23 A. I believe so. I believe -- I believe it was
- 24 | in there somewhere, but I don't. . .
 - Q. I've got a letter from Mr. Hopkins to



- 1 | Manheim asking about it.
- 2 A. Okay. It was -- I'm sorry.
- 3 Q. Is that what you think --
- 4 A. It was to Manheim, apparently.
- 5 Q. Okay. I'll -- I'll show you that in a bit.
- 6 A. Yeah, that's -- that's the -- that's the
- 7 one.
- 8 Q. Okay.
- 9 A. Because Manheim's the one that put me
- 10 in, so -- so I guess he sent the letter to them.
- 11 Q. And is this -- is this KO status -- KO Book
- 12 | status, is it affection you on the sales side at all?
- 13 A. No, just on the purchase side, you know.
- 14 Q. Okay. Do you -- I should have asked this
- 15 | earlier, but do you ever work as a representative
- 16 | for other dealerships?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 O. You -- since 2006, you've never bought or
- 19 | sold for another dealership?
- 20 A. Well, I -- I -- yeah, I stand corrected.
- 21 | I -- I probably have repped for people at auctions
- 22 | if they're --
- 23 | O. On --
- 24 A. -- they had some vehicles there.
- 25 Q. On sales?



- O. Okay. And who -- what dealers were
- 3 | that?

- 4 A. I remember doing it for Scott Auto Sales;
- 5 Parker & Sons. And then -- off the top of the
- 6 head, that's the ones I can remember, but that --
- 7 | that would have been prior to 2012, not
- 8 | since 2012.
- 9 Q. So you haven't repped cars for anybody
- 10 | since 2012 besides Mattingly?
- 11 A. I don't believe so; no.
- 12 Q. Okay. Have you had anybody buy from
- 13 Mattingly since 2012 under a different dealership's
- 14 | name?
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 16 A. I -- clarify that.
- 17 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 18 O. Okay. So earlier we talked about some
- 19 | repre -- representatives who have done some
- 20 | purchasing for you; right?
- 21 A. Right.
- 22 Q. And I'm assuming they do that under the
- 23 | name of Mattingly Auto Sales?
- 24 A. Correct; yes.
- 25 Q. So when they're at auction, they buy on



1 your account. 2 Α. Right. 3 Have you ever had a dealer buy on its Ο. 4 own account or another account and then convey 5 the car to you --6 Oh, since then? Α. 7 -- outside of auction? Ο. 8 Α. No. 9 Ο. Okay. You said "since then." Does that 10 mean since 2012? 11 Α. Yes. 12 Did you do that before 2012? 0. 13 Rarely. I don't recall any specific one. Α. don't -- I don't believe -- believe so. 14 15 Ο. Okay. 16 I just -- I just don't recall it. 17 But, theoretically, that would be a way Ο. 18 you could get cars from an auction --19 Α. Well --20 MS. LASKY: Object to the form --21 BY MR. MCCARTER: 22 -- to go -- to have another dealer buy them for you and -- and sell them for you? 23 24 I guess I could, but I don't -- I -- I --Α. 25 honestly, I don't recall ever having another dealer



- 1 Manheim.
- 2 Q. So this is -- these are the cars that you
- 3 | had bought with Manheim money that Manheim's
- 4 trying to repossess?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. Okay. Do you know whether these
- 7 | particular cars were recovered?
- 8 A. Yes. The -- let's start with the '94
- 9 GMC --
- 10 | O. Uh-huh.
- 11 A. -- that would be 706. This is the one
- 12 | where we voluntary -- voluntarily brought back to
- 13 | Manheim; spoke with Andrew -- blanking on his
- 14 | last name -- and left it -- you know, sent it back to
- 15 | Manheim Louisville.
- 16 0. Okay.
- 17 A. This is the one that is in question over
- 18 | the KO Book. It was in the repossession, and it's
- 19 | also in the bankruptcy. Mysteriously with this car,
- 20 | six days after we brought it back to them, it wound
- 21 | up in a junkyard.
- 22 | Q. Okay. And this is --
- 23 A. We have no idea why.
- 24 O. -- this is the GMC --
- 25 A. The 94.



October 19, 2016 121

- 1 Q. -- that ends in 562 VIN?
- 2 A. I don't see the -- yes. Yes, I do. Yes.
 - Q. Okay. But that car was not on your DSC
- 4 line.

- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. Okay. And then there's a -- I guess
- 7 there's a second car on 707?
- 8 A. Yes, this one here, 707 -- yes, seven --
- 9 Q. It's a Chevrolet 1500; 976 is the last of
- 10 | the VIN?
- 11 A. Yes. Yes. This car was -- they sent that
- 12 | to be repossessed. This particular truck had a
- 13 | story behind it, as well. It was on repo -- they
- 14 | sent it to repossess. This vehicle was paid off
- 15 when they came to get it. I had had it on the floor
- 16 | plan, but I had previously paid it off.
- 17 And a few days before the repossession, I
- 18 | actually had called and told -- asked them to -- "I
- 19 | was busy at work, and could you go ahead and mail
- 20 | me the title?" The title never -- after -- several
- 21 | weeks after repossession, we were actually looking
- 22 | for the title. Could not find it.
- 23 | Called the auction, and they had the title.
- 24 And I said, "Well, I'll be in Louisville that day.
- 25 | Don't worry about mailing it. I'll pick it up."



- 1 We went to pick up the vehicle -- or the title.
- 2 | And I put -- drove over here, and they had a lien
- 3 on the vehicle -- on a vehicle I had paid off. Not
- 4 only did they have that, but they was in Mattingly
- 5 Auto Sales' name, but the address was to Dixie
- 6 Auto Sales on Dixie Highway here in Louisville.
- 7 | They -- Manheim, two days after the
- 8 repossession on a paid-off vehicle, took this
- 9 vehicle, retitled it, put a lien on it, and sent the
- 10 | title to a dealer -- to -- in my name to another
- 11 dealer in Louisville.
- 12 Q. Okay. Did -- did you have an
- 13 understanding at all that -- that MAFS and DSC
- 14 have a blanket lien on all your inventory?
- 15 A. No, just --
- 16 | 0. Okay.
- 17 A. -- the ones that I had floored.
- 18 0. Okay. And on the -- going back to the
- 19 GMC that ends in 562 --
- 20 A. Uh-huh.
- 21 | Q. -- you said it was returned to DS -- or to
- 22 | Manheim. Where -- where was it when they tried
- 23 | to pick it up?
- 24 A. It was in our lot -- at our lot.
- Q. Okay. And why do you have these orders



- 1 to repossess? Just curious.
- 2 A. The -- the-- the repossession guy, the
- 3 | truck driver, actually let us have them, and we
- 4 made copies of them.
- 5 Q. Okay. All right.
- 6 And so at some -- after DSC recovers cars and
- 7 resells them, do you recall getting demand for
- 8 | payment of the deficiency?
- 9 A. I believe so; yes.
- 10 Q. Okay. And at some point that proceeded
- 11 | to litigation?
- 12 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. I'm going to show you what we're
- 14 going to call Exhibit 13.
- 15 | [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked
- 16 Defendants' Exhibit 13 for identification.
- 17 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 18 O. And this is Bates labeled MA 41 through
- 19 MA 61, and then it's -- in the middle of the exhibit
- 20 | it starts a different set of numbers, MA 656
- 21 | through 672. Does this look like, you know, filings
- 22 | and pleadings from that collection case?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 0. Okay. And this is something you've
- 25 | produced to us, so when -- when did you get



- 1 these? 2 Α. This -- I'm -- shortly thereafter, like -- it appears, like, in November of 12 according to the 3 4 stamp. And I'm assuming that -- I'm assuming that's about the same time when I --5 6 0. Okay. 7 -- when we got it. Α. 8 So you do recall getting served with Ο. 9 these when the case was pending? 10 Α. Yes. 11 Okay. And it -- it's DSC versus Mattingly Ο. 12 Auto Sales and you, personally, Barry Mattingly. 13 Do you see that? 14 Α. Yes. 15 And you had some understanding that you Ο. 16 were a quarantor on the line of credit? 17 Α. Yes. 18 Was your wife a quarantor on the Ο. 19 line of credit?
- 20 A. No.
- Q. Okay. And she's not named in this case?
- 22 A. No.
- Q. Okay. Do you -- I don't want to know
- 24 about discussions with your counsel, but do you
- 25 | recall what you did with this complaint when you



- 1 got served with it?
- 2 A. Oh, yeah, sure do.
- 3 Q. What did you do?
- 4 A. Well, my wife's laughing because it -- it
- 5 was a funny story, but, actually, I did nothing, and
- 6 my lawyer pretty much did the same.
- 7 Q. Okay.
- 8 A. Lawyers.
- 9 Q. And then later you got this motion for
- 10 default that starts at 656?
- 11 A. I -- [examines document].
- 12 Q. If you look at 658, it shows as -- that,
- 13 | you know, DSC representing it served it on you.
- 14 A. Six -- oh, I'm sorry. I don't have that.
- 15 Q. The motion starts at 656, and the
- 16 | certificate of service is on 658.
- 17 A. Oh, okay. Sure. Yeah.
- 18 Q. Do you recall getting that motion?
- 19 A. Yes, that looks familiar.
- Q. Okay. And again, you produced this to
- 21 | us; so it's in your records somewhere; right?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Okay.
- 24 A. I will give the -- can I -- I stop just to
- 25 give you a little bit? The -- my -- the lawyer -- I'm



- 1 from Kentucky, so I -- obviously, I had to have a
- 2 | lawyer that was licensed in Indiana.
- 3 Q. Uh-huh.
- 4 A. The lawyer I hired --
- 5 MS. LASKY: Wait. Wait. Just make sure
- 6 | you don't tell him what you discussed with that
- 7 lawyer.
- 8 THE WITNESS: Okay.
- 9 A. Well, basically, he got sick, so that's kind
- 10 of -- so that's where we -- what happened in that
- 11 case.
- 12 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 13 Q. Okay.
- 14 A. And so we had to move on.
- 15 Q. So you're saying that's why he didn't
- 16 | answer and it was a default?
- 17 A. Right.
- 18 O. Okay. And -- let's see -- if you keep
- 19 going back in that same exhibit at Page 665 -- it
- 20 starts at 665 and goes through the end of the
- 21 | Exhibit at 672, there's an affidavit of debt. Do you
- 22 | see that?
- 23 | A. Six -- it's on 665?
- 24 Q. Yes.
- 25 A. Okay. Yes.



1 And -- and I'll represent to you: Ο. This was 2 an exhibit to that motion for default that we looked 3 at earlier. And again, this is produced by you. 4 you have any reason to believe you didn't get that affidavit of debt? 5 6 Α. No. That's correct. Yeah, we re -- we 7 received this. 8 Okay. All right. I'm going to show what 0. 9 we're going to call Exhibit Number --10 MS. LASKY: 14. 11 THE REPORTER: 14. 12 BY MR. MCCARTER: 13 -- **14**. Ο. 14 MR. MCCARTER: Thank you. 15 MS. LASKY: No problem. 16 [WHEREUPON, off-the-record remarks are 17 made. 1 18 [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked Defendants' Exhibit 14 for identification.] 19 20 BY MR. MCCARTER: 21 So I just handed you 14 -- Exhibit 14. 0. 22 Α. Yes. 23 And this, again, is sort of a composite 24 exhibit, but it's -- it's -- it's documents you 25 produced to us that appear to be letters from DSC



- 1 and from MAFS in that May time frame.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Do you see that?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Do you recall -- since you produced them
- 6 to us, do you recall receiving all these letters
- 7 | around that time?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. Okay. And a few of them are dated a
- 10 | little later. Like if you look at Man -- MA 120, you
- 11 | know, it says --
- 12 A. Yes, I'm looking -- yes.
- 13 | 0. -- it says July 24, 2012. So you would
- 14 | have received it on or about that date?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 O. And that one, for example, is signed by
- 17 Donna Kronauer -- Kro -- that's the lady you spoke
- 18 | about before as representing MAFS?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Okay. Okay. All right.
- 21 Now, excepting the very last two pages, which
- 22 | are MA -- MA 131 and 132, do you recall receiving
- 23 the rest of those letters from DSC or MAFS as
- 24 | indicated?
- 25 A. 31, 32?



- 1 Q. I'm sorry, except for 131 --
- 2 A. Oh, I'm sorry.
- 3 Q. -- and 132, did you receive the --
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 | O. -- rest of them?
- 6 A. Yes, yes.
- 7 Q. Okay.
- 8 A. I believe so; uh-huh.
- 9 Q. And MA 131, 32 -- well, strike that.
- 10 MA 131 looks like a letter from your attorney
- 11 to DSC requesting information. Do you see that?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 O. And it's -- it's signed by Dwight Preston?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Is this the attorney you hired to deal with
- 16 | the complaint?
- 17 A. The -- the -- the original lawsuit in
- 18 | Indiana?
- 19 Q. Yeah.
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. Okay. So you hired Mr. Preston after
- 22 | that?
- 23 | A. Yes.
- 24 Q. All right. And is -- did you have a -- I
- 25 | don't want to know the details of it, but did you



- 1 have a relationship with him before that?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. Okay. Is he your general attorney?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. Okay. And so here you're asking for a
- 6 detailed analysis and accounting of the DSC
- 7 | claim?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 12 O. Okay. And is this something he did send
- on your behalf on or about October of -- 17, 2012?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Okay. The very last page of that exhibit,
- 16 MA 132, is a card for a Terry Dashner at DSC. Do
- 17 | you see that?
- 18 A. Uh-huh. Yes.
- 19 Q. How did you have that card? What does
- 20 | that have to do with this?
- 21 A. He had something to do with DSC. I
- 22 | remember the name, but I don't remember what he
- 23 | did.
- 24 Q. Okay.
- 25 Q. All right. And you had an understanding



- 1 that there was a judgement entered in that case
- 2 | DSC filed against you?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Okay. I'm going to show you what we're
- 5 going to call Defendants' Exhibit 15. Sorry.
- 6 [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked
- 7 Defendants' Exhibit 15 for identification.]
- 8 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 9 Q. This document, again, is a composite, but
- 10 | it's -- it's sort of, basically, two copies of -- of the
- 11 | judgement. It's 34 of 33 -- I'm sorry. Strike that.
- 12 It's NG 3433 through NG 3435, and then it's
- 13 MA 673 through MA 674. And it looks like it's sort
- 14 of NextGear's copy of a judgement against you and
- 15 | your copy of the judgement against you. Does that
- 16 | look right?
- 17 | A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. And as we sit here today, have you
- 19 | paid this judgement?
- 20 A. No.
- 21 Q. Do you have any intent to pay it?
- 22 A. No, it was discharged at bankruptcy.
- 23 Q. Okay. We'll come to that in a minute, but
- 24 | who filed bankruptcy?
- 25 A. Barry Mattingly.



1	Q.	And would
2	Α.	I did not huh?
3	Q.	Did your wife file with you?
4	Α.	Yes.
5	Q.	Okay. Did Mattingly Auto Sales pay
6	Α.	No.
7	Q.	Does Matting
8		MS. LASKY: Sorry. What was your
9	question?	
10	BY MR.	MCCARTER:
11	Q.	Does Mattig did Mattingly Auto Sales,
12	Inc. file bankruptcy?	
13	Α.	No.
14	Q.	Okay. Does Mattingly Auto Sales, Inc.
15	intend	to pay this judgement?

- 16 A. No.
- Q. Okay. If Mattingly Auto Sales, Inc. were to recover damages in this current case, do you
- 19 believe that it would be -- those will be offset by
- 20 the amount of that judgement?
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 22 A. I wouldn't have any idea.
- 23 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 24 Q. Okay. All right.
- 25 I'm going to show you what we're going to call



- 1 Defendants' Exhibit 16.
- 2 | [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked
- 3 | Defendants' Exhibit 16 for identification.]
- 4 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 5 Q. All right. And this is Bates labeled
- 6 NG 8820 through 8895. And I don't want to go
- 7 | through these in detail. I'll call your attention to
- 8 | particular pages, but this would appear to be,
- 9 | generally, the -- the bankruptcy papers that --
- 10 of -- of yours and your wife's bankruptcy file?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Okay. And it looks like, from the top of
- 13 | that, that that -- that this first document, the
- 14 | petition, was filed in -- September 27, 2013. Do
- 15 | you see that?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 | 0. Does that sound about right to you?
- 18 A. About right.
- 19 Q. Okay. And when you signed these
- 20 | bankruptcy papers, they were true, to the best of
- 21 | your knowledge?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. If you flip back to Page 8831 in there, in
- 24 | Exhibit 16, do you see about halfway down there's
- 25 | a list of a judgement in Hamilton Superior Court?



- 1 Do you see that?
- 2 A. Yes.
- Q. And that's the judgement DSC had against
- 4 you at the time?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And there's another judgement mentioned
- 7 | in Breckinridge Circuit Court, Division 1, a civil
- 8 | case right below that. Do you see that?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 | O. Who -- who is that case?
- 11 A. That was a -- like a Discover card.
- 12 Q. Okay. It's a -- a Discover card that went
- 13 | unpaid?
- 14 A. Yes, it -- it was in the bankruptcy.
- 15 O. And that was a personal Discover card?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 O. Do you remember the amount of that
- 18 judgement?
- 19 A. No. It's -- it -- I'm sure it's listed here,
- 20 | but I -- I don't remember it.
- 21 Q. Okay. And if we skip on back to
- 22 | Page 8860 --
- 23 | A. Okay.
- 24 Q. -- do you see that, it's called Schedule
- 25 | F?



October 19, 2016 135

		_		
1	7\	[20 0	andibla	wooman l
1	Α.	1110	augrbie	response]
_				

- Q. And the first two creditor names on there
- 3 | are Manheim Louisville and then NextGear Capital,
- 4 Inc. Do you see that?
- 5 A. Yes.

- 6 0. And it shows business debt of Manheim
- 7 | Louisville -- to Manheim Louisville of 9180?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 0. And is that the -- the -- is that -- was that
- 10 | an amount due to the auction or due to MAFS or
- 11 | both?
- 12 A. It was due to -- actually due to MAFS.
- 0. Okay. But as far as you know, this was
- 14 | an accurate statement of the amount at that time?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 O. Okay. And then it shows an amount due
- 17 to NextGear Capital of \$58,432.52. Do you see
- 18 | that?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. And that matches the judgement amount?
- 21 A. I believe so.
- 22 | Q. Okay. And I'll -- if you can turn back
- 23 to 8869?
- 24 A. [complies]
- 25 | Q. I realize these are digital signatures, but



- 1 you authorized your attorney to file these with
- 2 | your signature and your wife's signature?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 0. Okay. If you flip back to -- same exhibit,
- 5 to Number 8889 --
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. -- this looks like a -- a proof of claim
- 8 | filed by DSC in your bankruptcy. Do you see that?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And at the time they're saying the amount
- 11 | due is 59,879 and six -- 73 cents.
- 12 A. Yes.
- 0. Do you see that? And then there's some
- 14 | more detail attached to that at 8891 and following
- 15 | that?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 | O. Okay. Do you recall seeing that proof of
- 18 | claim at that time in the bankruptcy?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Okay. And did you or your attorney
- 21 | challenge that proof of claim in the bankruptcy?
- 22 A. Not that I'm aware of.
- 23 0. Okay.
- 24 A. He did pretty much everything.
- 25 Q. Do you recall specifically noting or



October 19, 2016 137

1 reserving any claims against DSC in your 2 bankruptcy? 3 Α. No. 4 Object to the form. MS. LASKY: 5 Α. No, I don't really know what that means, 6 but --7 BY MR. MCCARTER: 8 Q. Okay. 9 Α. What. . . 10 Do -- do you recall telling the bankruptcy Ο. 11 court on paper or orally that, "I have a valuable 12 claim against DSC" --13 Α. No. 14 -- "that's an asset"? Ο. 15 Α. No. 16 Okay. Do you recall having -- saying that Ο. 17 on paper or orally about MAFS, that you had a 18 claim against MAFS? 19 Α. No. 20 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 21 BY MR. MCCARTER: 22 Okay. And again, Mattingly Auto Sales, Q. 23 Inc. did not participate in that bankruptcy. 24 Α. Correct. 25 Q. Has Mattingly Auto Sales, Inc. filed



October 19, 2016 138

1 bankruptcy to date? 2 Α. No. 3 Okay. All right. All right. Ο. 4 And I'm sorry, at some point that bankruptcy 5 played out, and you were discharged in --6 Cor --Α. 7 -- the bankruptcy? 0. 8 Α. Yes. 9 0. Okay. And by "you," I mean you 10 personally and your wife personally. 11 Α. Yes. 12 Okay. Do you recall when -- when it was 0. 13 done and the discharge happened? I can look it 14 up, but I don't -- do you recall? 15 It was -- it was either the last --Α. 16 December of 13 or January 14. 17 Ο. Okay. 18 So I believe it was De -- actually Α. 19 December of 13. 20 0. Okay. All right. 21 I'm going to show what we're going to call 22 Defendants' Exhibit 17. 23 [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked 24 Defendants' Exhibit 17 for identification.]



BY MR. MCCARTER:

- 1 Q. And this is labeled -- Bates labeled
- 2 | MA 566 through 567?
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Have you seen this before?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. All right. Again, this is something you
- 7 | produced to us in the case?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 O. And it looks like it's a small claims
- 10 | complaint that you filed against NextGear Capital?
- 11 Do you see that?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 | 0. And the signature's dated
- 14 | October 24, 2013?
- 15 A. I believe so; yes.
- 16 | O. All right. So based on the rough dates
- 17 | we looked at before, this would have been while
- 18 | your bankruptcy was pending?
- 19 A. Yes, but they had to -- they delayed it
- 20 because of that, that they -- they wouldn't -- they
- 21 | wanted to stop it because of bankruptcy.
- 22 Q. They stopped this --
- 23 | A. Well -- or --
- 24 O. -- small claims case?
- 25 A. Yeah. Yeah, they stopped it or delayed



October 19, 2016 140

1 it. 2 Ο. Who's "they"? 3 Α. The -- the judge. So the -- the judge in this case didn't --4 Ο. 5 he didn't set you for hearing or -- or -- or didn't 6 accept what during that period? 7 Α. He -- because of -- due to the bankruptcy, 8 he wanted to delay the case. And I think it was 9 actually -- and I do not remember her name. Ιt 10 was a lawyer also requested from DSC -- or 11 NextGear. 12 Okay. And this is a claim for \$1836 plus 0. 13 court costs by you against NextGear? 14 Α. Yes. 15 Okay. And do you recall whether you 0. 16 listed this claim -- and I'm sorry. By "you," I mean 17 you personally; right? 18 Uh-huh. Α. 19 Q. And do you recall whether you listed this 20 claim as an asset in your bankruptcy? 21 Α. I do not recall.

Okay. And this looks like -- correct me if

I'm wrong, I'm just trying to summarize it, but it's

basically you -- related to some physical property

damage you think was incurred when NextGear

22

23

24

Q.

- 1 repossessed cars from you?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. To the extent the cars belonged to
- 4 Mattingly Auto Sales, Inc. and were repossessed
- 5 from that entity, why is this filed in your name and
- 6 | not the entity's name?
- 7 A. Because it --
- 8 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 9 A. This was on my personal property.
- 10 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 11 Q. Okay. What personal property?
- 12 A. My garage.
- Q. At your house?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. Okay. And is there anything in this case
- 16 about improper interest charges by NextGear or a
- 17 blacklisting by NextGear?
- 18 A. No, this doesn't have nothing to do with
- 19 that.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 A. I don't -- well, as far as I know.
- 22 Q. And do you remember how this was
- 23 | resolved?
- 24 A. Yes, they basically paid the claim,
- 25 NextGear.



- Q. Okay. Did -- was there ever a hearing or anything on this case?
- 3 A. No. They actually spoke to a lawyer.
- 4 | They called, and we settled it --
- 5 Q. Okay.
- 6 A. -- basically over the phone.
- Q. And I think there was a written settlement agreement; right?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. I'll show you that now.
- MR. MCCARTER: This is Exhibit 18.
- 12 WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked
- 13 Defendants' Exhibit 18 for identification.]
- 14 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 15 Q. This is labeled NG 3425 through 3431,
- 16 and then there's a couple of extra pages on the
- 17 | end that are MA 569, MA 581.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Have -- have you seen this first document
- 20 before that's called Settlement Agreement and
- 21 | Release?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 Q. Okay. And is this the agreement you
- 24 | signed with NextGear to settle that small claims
- 25 | case?



- 1 A. Yes, it is.
- 2 Q. So this relates to the small claims case
- 3 | at Exhibit 17; right?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Okay. And that is your signature on
- 6 | Page 3428?
- 7 A. [examines document] Yes.
- 8 Q. Okay. And then on the -- the second to
- 9 the last page, MA 569, it looks like there's a letter
- 10 delivering the check to you.
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 Q. Okay. And so NextGear did pay the
- 13 | settlement amount?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 | O. And then you filed a dismissal that's
- 16 | at 581?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 Q. Okay. If you look at the first page of the
- 19 | Settlement Agreement at 3425, about three
- 20 paragraphs down it does say the lawsuit was
- 21 disclosed to the trustee in the bankruptcy case.
- 22 Do you see that?
- 23 A. Yes.
- Q. Do you know whether that was true?
- 25 A. Yes, that sounds correct.



October 19, 2016 144

Okay. And you understood when you 1 Ο. 2 signed this that you were releasing your claims 3 against NextGear according to Paragraph 3, the 4 release language? Paragraph 3? Yes, for the garage 5 6 damage? Yes. 7 Okay, but you -- you did sign this 0. 8 Settlement Agreement as it's written here. 9 Α. I believe so; yes. Okay. And Pa -- and on 4, it says that 10 0. 11 this agreement -- under Section 4, [reads] This 12 agreement represents the entirement -- agreement 13 between the parties. 14 Do you see that? 15 Α. Yes. 16 Ο. Okay. And that was true? 17 Α. Yes. 18 I'm going to show you what I'm All right. Ο. 19 going to call Exhibit 19. 20 19. Α. [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked 21 22 Defendants' Exhibit 19 for identification.] 23 [WHEREUPON, off-the-record remarks are



BY MR. MCCARTER:

made.]

24

- 1 Q. This is la -- Bates labeled NG 7994
- 2 | through 7998.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. So what is this first page?
- 5 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 6 A. This is where we -- Mr. Hopkins sent a
- 7 | letter to Manheim about the KO Book, that I should
- 8 | not be in there due to the car -- truck was
- 9 discharged in bankruptcy.
- 10 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 11 Q. Okay. So mis -- at this point Mr. Hopkins
- 12 | is representing you?
- 13 A. On this case, yes.
- 14 Q. Okay.
- 15 A. This was in 15.
- 16 | 0. And it says he's been retained by Barry
- 17 | W. Mattingly. It doesn't say Mattingly Auto Sales
- 18 | there. Was it your understanding he was just
- 19 representing you personally?
- 20 A. Well, both, but it -- actually, in the KO
- 21 | Book it -- I believe, if I'm not mistaken, it's my
- 22 | name --
- 23 O. Okay.
- 24 A. -- not just -- not Mattingly Auto Sales so
- 25 much as it is Barry Mattingly.



- 1 Q. Okay. So seeing the date of this letter,
- 2 does that refresh your memory at all about when
- 3 | you talked to Carol at Wolfe's?
- 4 A. It would have been shortly there before,
- 5 | yes. So it -- it would have been a few -- I'm going
- 6 to say a few months before that.
- 7 Q. Okay. And you talked to Auction
- 8 Insurance Agency by phone somewhere between
- 9 | those two dates?
- 10 A. Right.
- 11 Q. Okay. And here he's -- he's suggesting
- 12 | that it's your understanding that he's been -- you
- 13 know, that you've been advised that Manheim
- 14 Auctions is responsible for your placement on that
- 15 | list of bidders that you're now calling the KO Book;
- 16 | right?
- 17 A. Yes, I believe it was mi -- one of the
- 18 | Auction Insurance reps.
- 19 Q. Okay. And here he's describing that as a
- 20 list of bidders who are required to verify their
- 21 | financial ability to purchase vehicles at auction.
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 | 0. And so he's -- neither he nor you are
- 24 | really saying it's impossible for you to purchase at
- 25 | auction. You're just saying it's more difficult?



October 19, 2016 147

	Α.					
2		MS.	LASKY:	Objection	to	form.

- 3 A. I can purchase some -- I cannot purchase
- 5 BY MR. MCCARTER:

at any Manheim.

- 6 Q. Okay. And he says in the middle
- 7 | paragraph that you believe it's in retaliation for
- 8 | your bankruptcy filing, and then also for the
- 9 disposition of that GMC Sierra; right?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Do you know one way or the other when
- 12 | you were put on the KO Book list?
- 13 A. I wouldn't know that. I do not know that.
- 14 Q. Okay. Did you get any response from
- 15 | Manheim to this letter?
- 16 A. No.
- 17 | 0. Did you send a copy of this letter to
- 18 DSC?
- 19 A. No.
- 20 O. The documents that come after that in
- 21 | that same exhibit --
- 22 A. Uh-huh.
- 23 | Q. -- 7995 and the following --
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. -- do they relate to this letter in some



October 19, 2016 152

- 1 contacted about being involved in this case by an 2 attorney in Louisiana about a year ago.
 - Α. Uh-huh.

3

7

8

- Okay. Before that, had you ever raised 4 0. the issue or discussed the issue with DSC about 5 6 when interest begins to accrue on floor plan cars?
 - Α. I had --MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 9 Α. I had spoke with Lourdes and Donna on a 10 couple occasions about always looking to save 11 money, and I questioned particularly NextGear and
- 12 their charging interest two days before it
- 13 happened -- or two days with -- you know, we put it
- 14 on today; they already charged you two days.
- 15 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 16 I think you said earlier that was MAFS; O. 17
- 18 Α. MAFS.

riaht?

- 19 0. Okay.
- 20 And with Lourdes, it was always -- I was Α.
- 21 always looking to cut -- you know, to save a dollar.
- And I asked her -- because one -- an occasion, I --22
- 23 I can't recall the exact vehicle or what happened;
- 24 but I got a vehicle -- like I say, I got a vehicle,
- 25 called -- got the -- I called to do -- pay the payoff,



October 19, 2016 153

- and they still didn't have the title, but yet I was charged. I probably asked her for a deal --
 - Q. Okay.
- 4 A. -- but I don't remember.
- 5 | O. And -- and that's those title-absent cars;
- 6 right?

- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 Q. Okay.
- 9 A. That's when I was aware, because it --
- 10 | it's -- DSC was different, because Manheim
- 11 | actually had an office in their auction.
- 12 | O. Yeah.
- 13 A. Dealer Services did not. They just had a
- 14 rep, so I didn't see much of anything like that.
- 15 Q. Did that happen with MAFS, too? I mean,
- 16 | they would start charging interest when they didn't
- 17 | have the title present yet?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And did that happen with AFC?
- 20 A. That I do not know. I'm -- I'm sure
- 21 | they -- I'm sure they all work alike, but --
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. -- I do not -- don't recall anything about
- 24 AFC.
- 25 Q. But in each of those cases, you had the



- car, already had it. You were doing whatever you wanted to do with the car.
- 3 A. Yes.
- 4 Q. Okay. And do you recall when those
- 5 discussions with Lourdes would have been?
- 6 A. No, no. I -- I don't -- I don't know any
- 7 dates.
- 8 Q. Okay. Do you recall when you would have
- 9 had the discussion with Donna about the two days
- 10 | of interest?
- 11 A. Yes, it would have been in her office.
- 12 | O. When?
- 13 A. Oh, the -- probably from day one when I
- 14 realized that they charged it on the compu --
- 15 | you -- you could look at it on the computer and see
- 16 | it.
- 17 O. Okay. So it was transparent to you,
- 18 | something that you were aware of.
- 19 A. Yeah. And I asked about it, and they
- 20 | said -- their standard answer -- I mean, both of
- 21 | them gave me the sta -- standard answer. "Well,
- 22 | that's the way we do it."
- 23 Q. Okay. And the same thing with the
- 24 | title-absent, that you -- you were aware you were
- 25 | being charged interest for that period. You just



- 1 didn't like it.
- 2 A. Yeah.
- 3 Q. Okay.
- 4 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 5 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 6 Q. And in each case, you continued to
- 7 | borrow from DSC and MAFS after those
- 8 | conversations?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. Okay. All right.
- 11 Do -- are you aware that in this case you have
- 12 | RICO allegations that I'll -- you know, I'm not --
- 13 I'm not trying to pin you to this summary, but
- 14 | generally you're alleging a conspiracy between
- 15 NextGear, Cox Automotive, Cox Enterprises, John
- 16 | Wick, and others. Are you aware of that?
- 17 A. Yes.
- 18 O. Okay. What's your understanding of how
- 19 | that conspiracy works?
- 20 A. As -- as far as the word "RICO," I didn't
- 21 know nothing about it. The only thing I've ever
- 22 | seen is on A&E channel with mobsters. Outside of
- 23 | that, I know nothing about it.
- 24 O. Okay. So -- but, factually, what is your
- 25 | understanding of how this conspiracy works?



- 1 A. Basically, they were charging interest on 2 titles they did not have.
- 3 Q. Okay. Are you -- are you aware of any
- 4 | specific conversations between NextGear and Cox
- 5 | Automotive about that?
- 6 A. No, I wouldn't -- I wouldn't have any idea.
- 7 Q. Are you aware of any specific
- 8 | conversations between NextGear and Cox
- 9 | Enterprises about that?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 Q. Are you aware of any specific
- 12 | conversations between NextGear and John Wick
- 13 | about that?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. Are you aware of any conversations
- 16 among any of those parties about the issue of
- 17 | charging interest?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Okay. And by "conversations," I mean
- 20 | emails, letters. You haven't seen any --
- 21 A. No.
- 22 | Q. -- of those?
- 23 A. No, I would have.
- Q. Okay. Do you -- do you have some --
- 25 | you -- I think you said earlier you understood that



October 19, 2016 157

1 Manheim acquired DSC sometime in 2012? 2 Α. Yes. 3 0. Okay. So did -- do you have any 4 knowledge about interactions between the Cox 5 entities and DSC before that? 6 No, I wouldn't have any. Α. No. 7 Okay. And just -- I think you said this, Ο. 8 but just to confirm: You never dealt with -- you 9 never had a line of credit with NextGear after DSC 10 and MAFS were merged into Next -- to become 11 NextGear? 12 After May of 12, no, we nev -- we didn't Α. 13 have -- ever have no business after May of 12. 14 Okay. Just the collection and bankruptcy 0. 15 stuff? 16 Α. Yes. 17 Okay. All right. 18 You've also got what's called an unjust 19 enrichment claim in this case where you're 20 suggesting that NextGear and/or the other 21 defendants received an unfair benefit from you --22 or an unjust benefit from you. What's your 23 understanding of that? 24 Α. Is that --

MS. LASKY: Object to the form.



October 19, 2016 158

1 I'm not really sure what -- the legal term, 2 but it seemed like I was paying them money that 3 they should not have had yet, you know, BY MR. MCCARTER: 4 5 Ο. And are --6 -- as far as the interest and stuff. Α. 7 Is -- is that focused on the Q. Okav. 8 title-absent cars? 9 Well, yes, and -- and I -- I -- of course, I 10 wouldn't know if they char -- how much they 11 charged daily, or if -- even if I -- even if they did 12 have a title, I don't know the length of it because, 13 you know, I just wouldn't have -- the printout did 14 not say that. So I wouldn't have caught it. 15 To the extent you had the cars at that 0. 16 point and you'd been able to take that by putting it 17 on your DSC or MAFS floor plan, what did -- why 18 do you think that's unfair? 19 Α. It's just --20 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 21 Α. -- costing me more money. 22 BY MR. MCCARTER: Okay. Did you -- I think you said 23 Ο. 24 title-absent cars were disclosed on the block or 25 some --



- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. So you could have not purchased
- 3 | title-absent cars if you chose to.
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Okay. And if you did choose to purchase
- 6 | a title-absent car, you could choose not to put that
- 7 on your DSC line.
- 8 A. Right.
- 9 Q. Okay. And to -- during the period when
- 10 | you had an AFC and a MAFS line, you could have
- 11 chosen to put the car on your AFC line instead of
- 12 | your MAFS line.
- 13 A. Like we -- yeah, we could choose --
- 14 | choose anybody, I guess.
- 15 | 0. And the same thing, when you had a
- 16 DSC/MAFS line, you could have chosen to put the
- 17 | car on MAFS instead of DSC.
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Or you could have chosen to pay cash for
- 20 them.
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. Of course, when I paid cash at the
- 24 | auction, if I wrote the auction a check today with a
- 25 | title-absent, they don't actually cash my check



- 1 until they receive the title.
- 2 Q. Okay. What benefit do you believe you
- 3 | conferred on John Wick, who's a Defendant in this
- 4 case?
- 5 A. I wouldn't have any idea.
- 6 Q. Okay. What benefit do you believe you
- 7 | conferred on Cox Enterprises in this case?
- 8 A. The same. I have no any.
- 9 Q. Okay. What benefit do you believe you
- 10 | conferred on Cox Automotive in this case?
- 11 A. No idea.
- 12 Q. Okay. All right.
- 13 You said before, I think, two -- correct me if
- 14 | this is wrong, but before 2012 you might
- 15 | have 20, 25 cars in the lot, or was it 15, 20?
- 16 A. Anywhere -- more like 15.
- 17 | O. Okay. And now you might have 1 or 2 on
- 18 | the lot?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Okay. But might you be owning other
- 21 | cars that are at auction or somewhere else?
- 22 | A. I could --
- 23 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 24 A. -- but that's -- right now that's the only
- 25 ones we have for sale.



1 BY MR. MCCARTER: 2 Okay. So, on average, you're owing 1 Ο. 3 or 2 cars at a time now? 4 Α. Yes. 5 Okay. And, on average, you think you Ο. 6 were owning 15 or so before --7 I'd be -- I'd have 15 and --Α. 8 -- before 2012? Ο. 9 Α. Yes. 10 Okay. Do you have any recollection of Ο. 11 sort of what your net income was annually from the automotive business between 2006 and 2012? 12 13 No, I don't -- I don't recall right off the Α. 14 top of my head. 15 Can you ballpark it? Ο. 16 I know -- I could give you ballpark of 17 gross sales --18 Ο. Okay. 19 -- if that would help you any. It -- it'd 20 be -- let's say prior to 12, we -- we would do 21 anywhere from 800. And I -- I think one time we 22 might have even hit a million. This year our gross 23 sales would luckily to -- be 60,000. 24 But, obviously, gross sales Okay. 25 doesn't -- hasn't --



- 1 A. Turn -- turned a --
- Q. -- yet subtracted out of your --
- 3 A. -- turned a profit.
- 4 Q. -- costs; right?
- 5 MS. LASKY: Wait, wait, wait.
- 6 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 7 Q. Gross sales hasn't yet taken out your
- 8 | cost of doing business; right?
- 9 A. Correct.
- 10 Q. All right. So do you have any
- 11 | recollection of what your net income was any time
- 12 | between 2006 and 2012?
- 13 A. No.
- 14 O. Would that be shown on accounting
- 15 records or tax returns that --
- 16 A. Tax; uh-huh.
- 17 | 0. -- that you would still have access to?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Okay. And since 2012, do you have any
- 20 | sense of what your net income would be from the
- 21 | automotive business?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 | 0. What is it?
- 24 A. I -- I don't recall the income last year.
- 25 | I -- I don't recall it off the top of my head.



- 1 0. Okay.
- 2 A. Very little. I mean, once you take
- 3 expenses as far as insurance, taxes, and that kind
- 4 of thing.
- 5 Q. Okay. But again, that would be shown in
- 6 your tax returns?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. And you still have access to all of those.
- 9 A. For the -- well, for -- go back a few
- 10 | years; yes.
- 11 Q. Okay. Is there -- besides your tax
- 12 | returns, are there any other records you can look
- 13 at to compare your pre-2012 income -- net income
- 14 | to your post-2012 net income?
- 15 A. I'm not sure. I'm not -- I don't know. I
- 16 | don't --
- 17 | O. Okay.
- 18 A. -- I don't know if we saved records that
- 19 | far back.
- 20 Q. Okay. Do you recall ever doing a net
- 21 | income statement?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. So if it's not in the tax returns, you'd
- 24 | have to reconstruct it from individual purchases
- 25 | and sales?



_			_	-	-		_
1	Α.	Yes,	and	then	the	computer	records.

- 2 Q. Okay. Have -- have you done any
- 3 | analysis of the amount of interest that you believe
- 4 NextGear overcharged you?
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. Do you have any estimate of what that
- 7 | would be?
- 8 A. No, none.
- 9 Q. Okay. If -- do you have records you
- 10 | could look at to determine that?
- 11 A. Probably not, maybe not that far back.
- 12 | 0. How far back --
- 13 | A. I --
- 14 | Q. -- would they go?
- 15 A. Well, I -- like your income tax, we're
- 16 | lucky we found what we did. I wouldn't -- I
- 17 | wouldn't think we could go back much more than
- 18 | five years. I wouldn't have any idea.
- 19 Q. But your tax returns are not going to
- 20 | show individual --
- 21 A. Right.
- 22 | Q. -- floors and payoffs, are they?
- 23 THE WITNESS: What?
- MS. LASKY: I just didn't want you to
- 25 | answer before he finished.



- 1 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. I do that a
- 2 | lot.
- 3 A. I do not know. I -- I didn't -- have to --
- 4 | wouldn't know how far back I'd have to go.
- 5 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 6 Q. Well, I just want to be clear: Your tax --
- 7 | your tax returns for the business will not show
- 8 | individually what you paid for a particular car and
- 9 | what you paid it off at; right?
- 10 A. No.
- 11 | Q. It's going to be an aggregate of all your
- 12 | income.
- 13 A. Correct.
- 14 | Q. Okay. How far back do your deal jackets
- 15 qo?
- 16 A. Oh, well, we -- I'd say we turned some in
- 17 | that -- probably at least five years ago. We've
- 18 | probably got some to 2009. I don't recall.
- 19 We had some tickets, but not that far back --
- 20 | auction tickets from 2007, but we don't -- don't
- 21 | have them -- have them all.
- 22 Q. Okay. And are all -- those all stored at
- 23 | your business lot?
- 24 A. Yes; uh-huh.
- 25 Q. Okay. How long has Jackson Hewitt been



- 1 your tax accountant? 2 Well, for -- since I was out of high 3 It -- it was Jackson -- it was Powell 4 It's now called Jack -- Jackson Hewitt Services. Powell Services, and I -- my parents had them, and 5 6 I did them even when I was in a high school job 7 and -- since 1980. 8 And they're --Ο. Α. 9 Basic --10 -- since -- hang on. Hang on a second. 11 Since 2006, they're been preparing your individual 12 returns and the returns for Mattingly Auto Sales, 13 Inc.? 14 Α. Yes. 15 Ο. Okay. And those are two separate 16 returns. 17 Α. Yes. 18 All right. Have you attempted to Okav. Ο. 19 calculate how much you've been damaged by the 20 alleged blacklisting in the KO Book? 21 Α. No.
- 22 Q. Do you have any records that would show
- 23 | the extent of that damage?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q. Okay. Have you applied for floor plan



- 1 | credit with anybody else since 2012?
- 2 A. No.
- 3 Q. Have you applied for any sort of business
- 4 | credit with anybody since 2012?
- 5 A. No.
- 6 Q. Okay. So you haven't been rejected. You
- 7 | just haven't applied.
- 8 A. Right.
- 9 Q. Okay. What have -- you know, so
- 10 | you're -- you're making a claim in this case for
- 11 damages from NextGear related to interest and
- 12 | blacklisting. What -- have you made any effort at
- 13 | all to calculate those damages yourself?
- 14 A. No.
- 15 Q. Okay. Have you done anything that you
- can think of to reduce those damages or to
- 17 | mitigate those damages?
- 18 A. I don't know what you're -- how you are --
- 19 how to answer that one.
- 20 Q. Yeah. So I -- you're claiming some sort
- 21 of damage from -- from the blacklisting and
- 22 | interest, and so what -- I'm asking you: Have you
- 23 done anything to try to prevent that damage or
- 24 reduce that damage?
- 25 A. From blacklisting?



- 1 O. Yeah.
- 2 A. A -- not -- not that I recall. I mean, I
- 3 don't know what you're looking for in that answer.
- 4 0. Okay. How about the interest issue?
- 5 Have you done anything -- demand payment of
- 6 interest back from NextGear?
- 7 A. No.
- 8 Q. Okay.
- 9 A. I mean --
- 10 | Q. Have you -- well, strike that.
- 11 Okay. Do you have an understanding that you
- 12 and the other Plaintiffs are seeking to represent a
- 13 | class of Plaintiffs in this case?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. What is your understanding of -- of that
- 16 | class?
- 17 A. The only thing --
- 18 MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 19 A. I don't know much about that stuff. It --
- 20 | legal stuff. The only thing I know, it's just a --
- 21 | "class action" means -- I -- I assume it to be a
- 22 group of people --
- 23 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 24 Q. Okay.
- 25 A. -- a group of entities or whatever.



October 19, 2016 169

	RED BARN WOTORS VS. COX ENTERPRISES	108
1	Q. Do you have some understanding it's	
2	other NextGear borrowers?	
3	A. Yes.	
4	Q. Okay. Do you have any idea of how far	
5	back or anything like that?	
6	A. No; huh-uh.	
7	Q. Okay. Have you spoken to any other	
8	dealers about this case?	
9	A. No.	
10	Q. Besides your attorney and your wife, have	
11	you spoken to anybody else about this case?	
12	A. No.	
13	Q. Do you have you made any kind of	
14	study of what the other NextGear dealers look like	
15	or what their business looks like?	
16	A. No.	
17	MS. LASKY: Object to the form.	
18	BY MR. MCCARTER:	
19	Q. Okay.	
20	A. No.	
21	Q. Do you have some understanding that	
22	other NextGear borrowers may be bigger than you?	
23	MS. LASKY: Object to the form.	

A. That's possible; yes.

25 BY MR. MCCARTER:



October 19, 2016 170

1 Do you -- have you heard of dealers Ο. 2 having multiple lots? 3 Α. With NextGear? 4 Ο. Yeah. 5 Α. No, I wouldn't know any --6 Q. Okay. 7 -- anything about their personal business. Α. Do -- do all dealers buy the same types of 8 0. 9 cars? 10 Α. No. 11 Ο. So they can be higher end? Lower end? 12 Α. Yes. 13 Some can deal in volume and some Okay. Ο. 14 can deal in just high-profit cars? 15 Α. Yes. 16 Okay. Do you -- do all dealers go to 17 auctions? 18 Α. I assume --19 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 20 -- I -- I don't know about the other Α. 21 people's business. You know, I wouldn't have any 22 idea. 23 BY MR. MCCARTER: 24 Okay. Do -- do you have some reason to Ο.

believe that all the other NextGear borrowers have



- 1 Q. -- cars you might own --
- 2 A. Yeah, other than cars.
- 3 Q. -- do you own a building or --
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. -- anything like that?
- 6 A. No.
- 7 Q. Okay. Do you have equipment for the
- 8 dealership?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. Okay. Is your job with Ford as an income
- 11 | quality inspector -- incoming quality inspector, is
- 12 | that a full-time job?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 O. Okay. And it has been for the whole
- 15 | time?
- 16 A. Yeah, for all -- yes --
- 17 Q. Okay.
- 18 A. -- 27 years.
- 19 Q. Twenty-seven years? Okay. So when did
- 20 | you work on the car business? Like what time of
- 21 the day?
- 22 A. Depending on what shift I was on,
- 23 | weekends or during the day I would --
- 24 A. Okay.
- 25 Q. At the time -- at the time of the re --



- 1 started, I'm trying to think what year. Basically, I
- 2 | worked night shift up until two thousand possibly
- 3 | seven. Then I went to day shift, a day-shift job.
- 4 Q. Is it fair to say your job with Ford is your
- 5 | main job?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Okay. What -- what do you make from
- 8 Ford now?
- 9 A. Last year maybe 100,000.
- 10 Q. Okay. And is that all salary, or is there a
- 11 | bonus component.
- 12 A. There are bonuses included in that.
- 13 Q. Okay. How's that changed since 2002 --
- 14 | two -- I'm sorry, 2012?
- 15 A. I -- really, the only other thing would
- 16 be -- is raises.
- 17 | O. So roughly from what level? I mean, I
- 18 | don't need exact numbers, but. . .
- 19 A. I'd say a 20% increase possibly.
- 20 Q. Okay.
- 21 A. You know, I'd -- I'd have to look back. I
- 22 | wouldn't have any -- you know, right off the top of
- $23 \mid my \text{ head.}$
- 24 | 0. Is it steady 3 --
- 25 A. Nor -- nor --



- 1 Q. -- 3% a year --
- 2 A. -- nor --
- 3 Q. -- or 5% a year?
- 4 A. Yeah, getting normal raises. Yeah, I --
- 5 | yes, that's about -- that's about right.
- 6 Q. Okay. And are the bonus -- what are the
- 7 | bonuses based on?
- 8 A. Profit sharing.
- 9 O. Okay. And that income has not been
- 10 | affected by the DSC situation?
- 11 A. No.
- 12 Q. Has it been affected for the positive? I
- mean, have you had more time to focus on Ford?
- 14 A. Well, yes, I have the same time of -- the
- 15 other was part-time.
- 16 Q. Okay.
- 17 A. Same thing.
- 18 O. Were there -- at -- at the time of the
- 19 NextGear default in, you know, May of 2012, were
- 20 there a couple of vehicles involved that you had
- 21 | acquired from ABC Bowling Green? Does that ring
- 22 | a bell?
- A. I'm sure I have. I'm sure I've purchased
- 24 | some there --
- 25 Q. Okay.



- 1 A. -- floored them from there; yes.
- 2 Q. Do you recall whether there were any
- 3 cars that you floored from ABC Bowling Green with
- 4 DSC that hadn't actually sold at ABC Bowling
- 5 Green?
- 6 | A. Yes.
- 7 Q. Okay. Can you tell me about those?
- 8 A. Yes. To put them on the floor plan,
- 9 | they -- with a suggested -- started with Art Felix to
- 10 | Lourdes to Donna Kronauer, they -- if I wanted to
- 11 | put them on a floor plan just to run them through
- 12 | the auction and for -- to another dealer to the --
- 13 through the -- through there or to put them on --
- 14 | we had to put them on the floor plan, more or less.
- 15 Q. But when you say "run them through the
- 16 | auction, " you mean they ran through, and then they
- 17 | didn't sell --
- 18 A. Right.
- 19 Q. -- and so you had a no-sale ticket.
- 20 A. Yeah.
- 21 Q. And then those were put on a floor plan
- 22 | with a no-sale ticket.
- 23 A. Yeah, or I purchased them from the
- 24 dealer whose name was in.
- 25 Q. But you used the no-sale ticket to put



- 1 them on the floor plan. 2 Well, it was a -- it was a no-sale ticket, Α. 3 but they would -- it would turn into a sale, I quess 4 you would say, to put them on the floor plan. 5 0. Well -- so I -- and if you don't --6 It's --Α. 7 -- know the answer, that's fine, but Q. 8 what's the value of -- of running it through and not 9 selling it? I mean, how does that help --10 Α. Well --11 -- for --Ο. 12 -- to -- to -- what -- what you're -- what Α. 13 you're asking is -- is to put them on the floor plan, 14 Lourdes and Art Felix would have to say, "Put 15 them -- run it through the auction as -- as a 16 post or trade, " and I don't -- I can't remember if 17 they do trades or not, but, "Run it through the 18 auction, have a -- you know, put it on there, and 19 we could put it on the floor plan as a sale through 20 the auction." 21 And the -- you know, I -- I said, "Well, that
- 21 And the -- you know, I -- I said, "Well, that 22 sounds like a winner to me," because it sounded 23 like a good deal.
- Q. Okay. And you're say -- so you're saying they're fully aware that it didn't sell at auction.



October 19, 2016 182

1 That is just ran and --2 They are --Α. 3 -- no sale. Q. 4 Α. Yes. Yes. 5 Ο. Okay. 6 Α. Yes. 7 And do you know anything about a Post Ο. 8 Office Box 66 that titles may have been sent to 9 related to your dealer --10 Yes, it was Breckenridge Automotive. Α. 11 Okay. So what is -- what is Breckenridge 0. 12 Automotive? 13 It's -- it's a business that we would put Α. titles, you know, if it just -- detail work, parts, or 14 15 something, me and a friend of mine we had some --16 starting a business, but it was never an official car 17 lot. 18 THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. It was or 19 wasn't? 20 THE WITNESS: It was never a -- not an official car lot. 21 22 THE REPORTER: Thank you. 23 As opposed to an auto sales. Α. 24 BY MR. MCCARTER: 25 Q. So you were doing business with a friend



- 1 under the name of Breckenridge Automotive.
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. And there you did detail work?
- 4 A. Detail, parts, you know, tru -- you know,
- 5 anything that we needed to do. We just never did
- 6 | use it, and then dissolved it.
- 7 Q. All right. And was it -- so when you say
- 8 | "dissolved it," does that mean it was a legal
- 9 entity? Did you --
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 | Q. -- incorporate it?
- 12 A. Yes, it was an LLC.
- 13 | O. Okay. Who was the friend?
- 14 A. It was Richard Smiley, and the entity was
- 15 | owned by Denise, my wife.
- 16 0. Is there any reason you would have titles
- 17 | for cars that were on your NextGear floor plan or
- 18 | your DSC floor plan sent to that address?
- 19 A. Yes. They had to have a -- they had to
- 20 | have a title from -- from a -- someone else other
- 21 | than Barry Mattingly. So with their -- they told me
- 22 | how to do this, the reps, to put it into a dealership
- 23 | name or some other name. The dealer would sign
- 24 | it to Mattingly Auto Sales, and we could put it on
- 25 | the floor plan.



- 1 So you're -- you're saying that you were Ο. 2 advised to create a -- an apparent transaction 3 between Breckenridge and Mattingly Auto sales so 4 that that car could be floored with NextGear. 5 Α. Yes. 6 Ο. Okay. And you're saying that the 7 DSC/NextGear people told you to do that? 8 Α. Well, they -- well, they said it would 9 work, and that's how I could put them on that way. 10 And that's what I did. 11 Ο. Okay. And who specifically advised you 12 of that? 13 The first person was Art Felix, and then Α. 14 Lourdes and then Donna at MAFS. 15 Would -- but Donna wouldn't have spoken Ο.
- 17 A. No, no.
- 18 | Q. -- floor plan --

for the Next -- for the DSC --

19 A. No.

- 20 Q. -- right?
- 21 A. No, but she was aware of it because --
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. -- she'd actually done some for me,
- 24 so. . .
- 25 Q. Would -- would DSC typically finance



October 19, 2016 185

- those cars at the price that you showed on the
 ticket between Breckenridge and you?
- 3 A. Yes.
- Q. And that -- that was sort of an artificial price that your two entities made up?
- A. Right, or -- it was always under their -- under their level, under their max-out range, I guess.
- 9 Q. And Breckenridge didn't have a line with
 10 DSC --
- 11 A. No.

15

- 12 Q. -- right? Okay.
- So you're moving cars from Breckenridge's
 name to Mattingly Automotive's name so they can

be put on Mattingly Automotive's floor plan?

- 16 A. Correct.
- Q. Okay. So how did Breckenridge acquire the cars in the first place?
- A. Oh, that -- I mean, just regular
 purchases. I mean, just trades or trade-ins or
 anything like that.
- Q. Were they purchased and traded -- were they purchased by Breckenridge or traded to Breckenridge, or had they been purchased by Mattingly in the first place?



- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 2 A. Purchased by Mattingly. I mean, it was
- 3 | our -- it was our vehicle, but they told me how to
- 4 | show -- I needed to have the title done to someone
- 5 | else's name.
- 6 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 7 O. Okay. So did the title show Mattingly
- 8 | Auto Sales assigned to Breckenridge, Breckenridge
- 9 assigned back to Mattingly Auto Sales?
- 10 A. No, no. It was a new title. It was always
- 11 dealer at the la -- it was -- would say Bracken --
- 12 | so this title here was Breckenridge Automotive, or
- whoever it may be; then I would dealer assign it to
- 14 | Mattingly Auto Sales, and then sold -- you know,
- 15 | put on the floor plan.
- 16 O. Okay. So did -- did Breckenridge
- 17 | Automotive have a dealer license?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. Okay. So it was dealing in cars without a
- 20 dealer license.
- 21 A. Right.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. It was like an individual, your name or
- 24 | something like that. It just couldn't be in my
- 25 | personal name or Mattingly Auto Sales to -- on a



- 1 trade.
- Q. Do you have any idea how many times this happened --
- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. -- over the years?
- 6 A. That -- no.
- 7 Q. Estimate?
- 8 A. No, I wouldn't have any idea.
- 9 Q. Okay. Do you -- do you have a sense of
- 10 | whether Breckenridge Automotive was supposed to
- 11 | have a license under the law to transfer those
- 12 | cars?
- 13 A. Yes, they would not have -- it was --
- 14 | there's no need to, because it was not a
- 15 | dealership; don't need to have a license.
- 16 O. Okay. All right.
- 17 | So -- but just to be clear: We're talking about
- 18 | cars that belong to Mattingly Auto Sales being
- 19 | assigned to Breckenridge and being assigned back
- 20 to Mattingly so they could be put on the NextGear
- 21 | floor plan.
- 22 A. Correct, but it actually wouldn't be
- 23 | assigned -- well, as far as what you're assigning,
- 24 | it would be tilted. I'd have a title.
- 25 Q. Okay.



- 1 A. And -- and then -- then reassigned -- or 2 assignment to Mattingly Auto Sales.
- Q. Okay. Breckenridge got that title in its name in the first place somehow; right?
 - A. Right.

5

- Q. All right. So how did it do that?
- 7 A. Just transferred it.
- 8 Q. From Mattingly Auto Sales.
- 9 A. Or -- Mattingly Auto Sales or a trade-in 10 from John Doe or whoever.
- Q. Okay. So we're talking about cars that
 were originally purchased by Mattingly Auto Sales
 or traded to Mattingly Auto Sales. You assigned
 those to Breckenridge. Breckenridge gets a new
 title, and assigns those back to you.
- 16 A. Through the -- run through the auction.
- Q. So the second part -- the second transaction from Breckenridge to you is run through the auction?
- A. Or -- yeah, or -- could be, or -- I could run it through the auctions or just give it to them and say, "Here, Donna. Here's the title. Put it on the floor plan."
- Q. Okay. That's fine. I -- I just want to be clear that they -- these are cars started out



- 1 belonging to Mattingly --
- 2 A. Yeah. Well --
- 3 Q. -- Auto Sales; right?
- 4 A. I misspoke, I guess. Breckenridge
- 5 | Automotive couldn't run it through the auction
- 6 | because they're not a dealer. Your -- that's
- 7 | correct; yeah.
- 8 Q. They -- they could not them run through
- 9 auction.
- 10 A. Right.
- 11 Q. Okay. So again, Mattingly Auto Sales
- 12 | may have acquired it at auction or by trade-in;
- 13 | right?
- 14 A. Uh-huh; correct.
- 15 Q. Okay. And then you assign them or
- 16 | convey them to Breckenridge Automotive; right?
- 17 A. Right.
- 18 | O. And that wouldn't happen at auction
- 19 | because Breckenridge couldn't go to auction.
- 20 A. That's correct.
- 21 Q. Okay. And so then Breckenridge is going
- 22 to assign them back to you, Mattingly Auto Sales.
- 23 | And they're getting -- they're not going to go to
- 24 | auction because Breckenridge can't go to auction;
- 25 | right?



- 1 A. Correct.
- 2 Q. And then Mattingly Automotive is going to
- 3 | take that car and put it on its -- its DSC floor plan.
- 4 A. Correct.
- 5 Q. Okay. Do you think that happened more
- 6 | than five times?
- 7 A. I -- I'd -- I'd have to look. I -- I don't
- 8 know. It's possible. It's possible. I don't know.
- 9 Q. Okay. Did you have any sense that DSC
- 10 | might be relying on the --the price that you --
- 11 | Breckenridge created to Mattingly as the floor plan
- 12 | amount?
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 14 A. You have to -- run it by me again.
- 15 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 16 | O. Okay. So did -- did DSC finance those
- 17 | cars at the price that Matt --
- 18 A. We put on -- yes.
- 19 MS. LASKY: Wait, wait, wait.
- 20 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 21 Q. -- that you put on?
- 22 MS. LASKY: Let him -- let him finish.
- 23 THE WITNESS: I'm sorry. I'm sorry.
- 24 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 25 Q. Did DSC finance those cars at the price



October 19, 2016 191

- 1 that Breckenridge and Mattingly assigned to that
- 2 second transaction?
 - A. Yes.

- 4 Q. Okay. Did -- were you -- as Mattingly
- 5 Auto Sales or through Breckenridge, were you ever
- 6 | involved in creating bills of sale later on cars that
- 7 | had already been assigned to you?
- 8 A. To put them on MAFS and the -- yes, we'd
- 9 | have to have a bill of sale.
- 10 Q. Okays. So sometimes you would have
- 11 | gotten the car title to you long before, but then
- 12 | you would create a bill of sale to -- to put it on the
- 13 | floor?
- 14 A. Yes. I'd have to have a -- from
- 15 | Breckenridge, just use it as example, Breckenridge
- 16 to Mattingly, I'd have to have a bill of sale. And
- 17 | they would -- that was also a requirement from the
- 18 | floor plan companies.
- 19 Q. Okay. So I -- I understand the floor plan
- 20 | companies required a bill of sale, but are you --
- 21 | are you saying the floor plan companies told you
- 22 | to go out and create a bill of sale for a transaction
- 23 | that occurred months before and will --
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. -- put it on the floor?



- 1 A. Uh-huh.
- Q. Okay. Did you -- did -- at the time, did
 you see any problem with that, that it might be a
- 4 mis-representative bill of sale?
- 5 A. No, because both -- like I said, both
- 6 representatives were aware of it, so it seemed like
- 7 | something like, you know, they -- they didn't mind.
- 8 Q. Okay. Would -- would the -- the -- when
- 9 | you and -- when Breckenridge assigned price on its
- 10 | deal on Mattingly Auto Sales, was that always the
- 11 | same price at which Mattingly had acquired it at
- 12 | auction?
- 13 A. That I wouldn't know. I can't remember
- 14 all that stuff. It's -- that's so long ago.
- 15 Q. Is it possible --
- 16 A. I couldn't give you numbers.
- 17 | 0. -- it was at a higher price? So in other
- 18 | words, you originally required as Mattingly at one
- 19 | price, then you convey to Breckenridge for -- for
- 20 | nothing, and then Breckenridge conveys it back to
- 21 | Mattingly at a higher price?
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 23 A. I mean, it's possible depending on if
- 24 | there was repairs involved. I -- I -- I just don't
- 25 | recall specifics.



October 19, 2016 193

1 BY MR. MCCARTER: 2 Okay. So -- but in -- if that happened, Ο. 3 you could be financing it with NextGear at a higher price than you paid at auction for it. 4 5 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 6 I'd just have -- it's -- I quess that would Α. 7 make sense, but I just -- I don't recall doing it. I 8 mean, I just don't recall the details. 9 BY MR. MCCARTER: 10 You don't recall either way? You can't 0. 11 say --12 No, I --Α. 13 -- it happened? Q. 14 Α. -- I don't know. I don't know. 15 MS. LASKY: Object to the form. 16 BY MR. MCCARTER: 17 So besides Breckenridge -- oh, strike Q. 18 that. 19 Breckenridge Automotive, LLC, is that a 20 Kentucky LLC? 21 Α. Yes. 22 Okay. Is it still existing? Q. 23 Α. No. 24 When was it shut down? 0. 25 Α. I think maybe two years ago.



- 1 | O. Okay. Did it file tax returns?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 Q. All right. And did it have profit --
- 4 A. No.
- 5 | Q. -- during -- at all?
- 6 A. Huh-uh.
- 7 Q. Okay. Did it file its own returns, or did
- 8 | it -- or was it passed through to you, and you --
- 9 A. It filed its own return -- had to file --
- 10 | LLCs in Kentucky have to file their own return.
- 11 Q. Okay. And did Jackson Hewitt do those,
- 12 | too?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Okay. And how -- what -- what years,
- 15 | roughly, was Breckenridge Automotive in
- 16 | existence?
- 17 A. I'd say 10, 11, 12 -- probably about
- 18 | four years, from, say, 12 to -- or 11 -- or 10
- 19 to 14 possibly.
- 20 O. 2010 to 2014?
- 21 A. Possibly, yes.
- 22 Q. Okay.
- 23 A. I'd have to -- I don't remember, to be
- 24 honest with you. That's close. Somewhere in that
- 25 | time frame definitely.



October 19, 2016 195

- Q. Do you recall Breckenridge Automotive ever dealing at auction, Manheim or otherwise?
 - A. No.

- 4 Q. Okay. Have you or your wife ever done
- 5 your own business under any other entity besides
- 6 | Mattingly Automotives -- Automobile Bill -- excuse
- 7 | me, Mattingly Automotive Sales, Inc. or
- 8 | Breckenridge Automotive?
- 9 A. No.
- 10 Q. Okay. All right.
- 11 I'm just going to read a paragraph to you from
- 12 | your declaration in this case to support your
- motion for class certification. Paragraph 7 says,
- 14 [reads] As a result of Defendants' conduct alleged
- in the verified amended complaint, Mattingly Auto
- 16 | Sales has suffered monetary loss, including, but
- 17 | not limited to, interest and fees on money not lent
- 18 and damage to its business relationships.
- 19 Do you recall signing that?
- 20 A. It sounds familiar, but. . .
- 21 Q. Okay. Is that true?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. All right. So we covered damages
- 24 earlier, but do you -- what is your best
- 25 understanding of -- of the amount of your damages



October 19, 2016 196

- 1 as we sit here today?
 2 A. I wouldn't --
- 4 A. I wouldn't have any idea about that.

MS. LASKY: Objection.

5 BY MR. MCCARTER:

- Q. Okay. What is your understanding of the type of damages you have as we sit here today?
- 8 A. I -- like I said, once again, I -- I just 9 wouldn't have any idea; wouldn't know how to 10 answer that one.
- Q. Okay. So I -- I think you said you
 sometimes would work on some cars you acquired
 at auction before you sold them; is that right?
- 14 A. Correct.
- Q. Okay. What -- I mean, just give me some examples of what that might look like.
- 17 A. Cleanup, tires, maybe some paint work,
 18 just various.
- 19 Q. All right. And those things cost money?
- 20 A. Absolutely.
- Q. And do -- do you have some way to track
 those and take them off out of your profit on the
 unit?
- 24 A. Yes.
- Q. Okay. And how do you do that?



October 19, 2016 197

1 What -- what do you mean? Α. 2 How do you figure out -- how do you keep O. 3 track of what you --4 Α. Oh. 5 0. -- spend on a car --6 We have a fi --Α. 7 -- that's not --Q. 8 MS. LASKY: Wait. Wait a minute. 9 BY MR. MCCARTER: 10 Let me finish. Ο. 11 Α. I'm sorry. 12 How do you keep track of what you spend Ο. 13 on a car besides just purchase price and figure out 14 what your net profit is? 15 We have a file for each individual, say, Α. 16 like a repair shop, paint shop, different -- any time 17 a ticket's made, it goes to that -- into their folder. 18 Okay. But you track that by car with Ο. 19 the --20 Α. Yeah. We --21 -- deal jackets --0. 22 -- also can do it by cars. Α. 23 -- with the dealer jackets we talked about 24 before; right? 25 Α. Yes.



October 19, 2016 198

1 Q. Okay. 2 Α. Yes. 3 I'm going to show you one more exhibit Q. I mean, I'm not promising it's the last, but it 4 5 might be. 6 20. MS. LASKY: 7 MR. MCCARTER: Let me get my stickers. 8 Thank you. This will be called Exhibit 20. 9 [WHEREUPON, document referred to is marked Defendants' Exhibit 20 for identification.] 10 11 BY MR. MCCARTER: 12 And this is labeled -- Bates labeled 0. 13 NextGear -- I'm sorry, NGR 1 through NGR 10. 14 And I'll represent to you that this is a report that 15 NextGear created in this litigation to show the 16 vehicles that you had floor planned with it. I don't -- I'm just curious: Have you seen this 17 18 before? 19 Α. I believe so. 20 Q. Okay. 21 I believe we have that. Α. 22 I'm -- I'm not holding you to any specific Q. 23 transaction, but when you reviewed it and as you

review it now, do you see anything that looks

wrong or completely out of whack on it?

October 19, 2016 199

1 A. No, not --

MS. LASKY: Object to the form.

- 3 A. I wouldn't really know. It's -- no, it looks
- 4 | like a list of cars, you know.
- 5 BY MR. MCCARTER:

- 6 Q. I'll just tell you, too, the stock numbers
- 7 on here go through 165. They start at 1, and then
- 8 | they go through 165 as far as dates, you know,
- 9 | earliest in time to latest in time.
- 10 Does -- does that sound about like the number
- 11 of cars you would have floor planned with
- 12 | DSC, 165?
- MS. LASKY: Object to the form.
- 14 A. I wouldn't have any idea. I'd have to go
- 15 | back to look. I wouldn't know a -- wouldn't know a
- 16 | specific number.
- 17 BY MR. MCCARTER:
- 18 | O. Okay. And I don't -- I'm not sure where
- 19 | I've seen it, but I thought in either your
- 20 interrogatory responses or your declaration that
- 21 | you estimated 100 or so cars with DSC. Does that
- 22 | sound about right?
- 23 A. I believe.
- Q. Okay. And so if there were 165, that
- 25 | wouldn't be way off?

